



Aalborg Universitet

AALBORG UNIVERSITY  
DENMARK

## Combining virtual reality and biofeedback to foster empathic abilities in humans

Schoeller, Felix ; Bertrand, Philippe; Gerry, Lynda; Jain, Abhinandan; Horowitz, Adam Haar; Zenasni, Franck

*Published in:*  
Frontiers in Psychology

*DOI (link to publication from Publisher):*  
[10.3389/fpsyg.2018.02741](https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2018.02741)

*Creative Commons License*  
CC BY 4.0

*Publication date:*  
2019

*Document Version*  
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication from Aalborg University](#)

### *Citation for published version (APA):*

Schoeller, F., Bertrand, P., Gerry, L., Jain, A., Horowitz, A. H., & Zenasni, F. (2019). Combining virtual reality and biofeedback to foster empathic abilities in humans. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 9, Article 2741.  
<https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2018.02741>

### **General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal -

### **Take down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us at [vbn@aub.aau.dk](mailto:vbn@aub.aau.dk) providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



# Combining Virtual Reality and Biofeedback to Foster Empathic Abilities in Humans

Felix Schoeller<sup>1,2\*</sup>, Philippe Bertrand<sup>3,4,5</sup>, Lynda Joy Gerry<sup>6</sup>, Abhinandan Jain<sup>7</sup>, Adam Haar Horowitz<sup>7</sup> and Franck Zenasni<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Centre de Recherches Interdisciplinaires, Université Paris Descartes, Paris, France, <sup>2</sup> U1001, Institut National de la Santé et de la Recherche Médicale, Paris, France, <sup>3</sup> Frontiers VR Laboratory (CRI Labs), Institut Innovant de Formation par la Recherche, USPC, Centre de Recherches Interdisciplinaires, Paris, France, <sup>4</sup> Laboratoire Adaptations Travail-Individu, Université Paris Descartes – Sorbonne Paris Cité, Institut de psychologie, Paris, France, <sup>5</sup> BeAnotherLab Research, BeAnotherLab Association, Barcelona, Spain, <sup>6</sup> Enactive Virtuality Lab, Tallinn University, Tallinn, Estonia, <sup>7</sup> Fluid Interfaces Group, MIT Media Lab, Cambridge, MA, United States

**Keywords:** empathy, compassion, aesthetic chills, psychogenic shivers, altruism, technology, biofeedback, emotion-regulation

## OPEN ACCESS

### Edited by:

Andrea Gaggioli,  
Catholic University of Sacred Heart,  
Italy

### Reviewed by:

Lily Anna Brown,  
University of Pennsylvania,  
United States

### \*Correspondence:

Felix Schoeller  
felix.schoeller@gmail.com

### Specialty section:

This article was submitted to  
Clinical and Health Psychology,  
a section of the journal  
*Frontiers in Psychology*

**Received:** 21 July 2018

**Accepted:** 19 December 2018

**Published:** xx January 2019

### Citation:

Schoeller F, Bertrand P, Gerry LJ, Jain A, Horowitz AH and Zenasni F (2019) Combining Virtual Reality and Biofeedback to Foster Empathic Abilities in Humans. *Front. Psychol.* 9:2741.  
doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2018.02741

Recent technological advances coupled with progress in brain and psychological sciences allow the controlled induction and regulation of human psychophysiological states. These progresses often aim toward the goal of developing human-machine interfaces to improve human factors such as mental health, human relations, well-being, and empathy. In this short article, we present some of such devices with a particular emphasis on technology aiming to foster empathic abilities in humans; that is, our ability to care, understand, and help our fellow human beings. In order to discuss any possible use for such devices in a clinical setting, we start by outlining definitions for the terms used in the article, and present three devices designed with the goal of modulating empathy in humans.

## UNDERSTANDING EMPATHIC PHENOMENA

Empathy is a vague term often used to describe a broad range of phenomena. These empathic phenomena are related to several interconnected motor, cognitive, emotional, motivational, and behavioral functions (McCall and Singer, 2013). Two of the most discussed aspects of empathy are affective and cognitive empathy. Cognitive empathy simply refers to the ability to predict various mental states of another person (Reniers et al., 2011; Myszkowski et al., 2017). Affective empathy refers to an isomorphic emotional response to somebody else's feelings, combined with a clear self-other distinction—i.e., a metacognitive ability to recognize another as being separate from oneself (de Vignemont and Singer, 2006; Decety and Meyer, 2008; Singer and Lamm, 2009; Decety, 2010).

Affective empathy may lead to both positive and negative effects. Highly distressing empathic stimuli for example can lead observers to develop empathic distress, which in turn may lead to burnout (Hojat et al., 2009; Klimecki et al., 2013), or to self-centered responses with negative consequences on social behavior (Decety, 2010). To a certain extent, the negative effects of affective empathy can be trained, limited, and avoided. When such top-down processes of emotion regulation are successful in limiting the stress response, subjects can learn to transform empathic distress into healthy and prosocial reactions.

One critical prosocial mechanism is the emotion of compassion (Decety, 2010). Compassion involves recognizing someone else as part of a collective shared humanity and extending benevolence and care for the welfare of that individual. While empathy triggers a parallel isomorphic emotion to another person's distress, compassion has been found to trigger neural

areas related to affiliation (Klimecki et al., 2014). In the following sections we examine how various technologies attempt to predict and control both negative and positive effects of these empathic phenomena at the three levels of mind, brain, and behavior.

## BIOFEEDBACK AND BRAIN CONTROL INTERFACES TO MODULATE EMPATHY

Biofeedback mechanisms and brain-control interfaces are two of the main kinds of technology aiming to regulate the negative effects of affective empathy. Bio-feedback mechanisms are interactive systems, which record biosensor data to provide real-time feedback to the user through data visualizations, games, cinematic narratives, or virtual environments. Biofeedback systems have been incorporated into so called “serious games” to train self-awareness and emotion regulation abilities. This is often done so by means of reward: better performance at emotion regulation leads to in-game advantages.

For example, feedback of cardiovascular related signals has been found effective in reducing anxiety before public speaking presentations (Azevedo et al., 2017). By decreasing heart rate through a tactile feedback device, Azevedo and colleagues led participants to experience relaxation in a stressful context, in comparison to subjects exposed to accurate biofeedback. Concerning affective empathy and social emotions, one biofeedback game created by Blandon et al. (2016) aims at enhancing empathy in teenage populations. In this game, virtual telekinetic abilities and time-manipulation are mapped to changes in attention and self-regulation. In order to effectively cooperate and solve tasks collaboratively, the user must control attention and stress in response to visual parameters and objects.

Another line of work aiming to regulate affective empathy are brain computer interfaces (BCI). BCI function by measuring brain activity, extracting neural signatures, translating such neural signatures into computer commands, and providing this information back to the users through an interface (Vourvopoulos et al., 2017). BCI use neural measures to index attentional, emotional, and cognitive states. For example, evidence suggests that frontal alpha asymmetry can provide reliable estimation of emotional valence (Davidson et al., 1990), and that prefrontal brain activity is strongly related to the process of mentalizing (Heatherton et al., 2006). These studies are conducted under the assumption that users provided with information about their own psychophysiological activity through BCI feedback become increasingly aware of their own empathic arousal and cognitive engagement (Cavazza et al., 2014). Some researchers have also argued that combining biofeedback with compassion practices can maximize psychological and physical effects (e.g., Klich, 2015). Compassion meditation training is a technique for improving emotional self-regulation (Pace et al., 2009), and previous research has demonstrated effects of compassion training techniques on decreased stress-related behavioral and neurobiological responses (Carson et al., 2005; Gilbert and Procter, 2006; Lutz et al., 2008).

This early research is promising, yet much work needs to be conducted to verify the effects of technologies such as biofeedback and BCI on the regulation of human empathy. The following section presents a more specific technique to train empathic abilities, where users are invited to experience the sensory input of another person rather than their own. Embodied Virtual Reality (EVR), allows users to access sensorial data concerning the body of another person, its immediate context and peripersonal space.

## EMBODIED VIRTUAL REALITY FOR EMPATHY TRAINING

The illusion of body ownership, or embodiment illusion, is a technique allowing users to virtually experience the body of another person (Botvinick and Cohen, 1998; Maselli and Slater, 2013). This alteration of self-representation through virtual reality (EVR) may lead to changes in behavior, referred to as *the proteus effect* (Yee and Bailenson, 2007). It seems that this effect relies much on the user's social schemas, stereotypes and models. For example, male subjects embodying an avatar of Sigmund Freud dialoguing about their personal problems with a virtual self can improve mood (Osimo et al., 2015). Similarly, embodying an avatar of Albert Einstein may increase performances in cognitive tasks (Banakou et al., 2018). By combining multimodal sensory and motor stimulations with first-person perspective visual input, this type of experience can lead users to feel actively engaged in a controlled virtual environment, and to behave in a realistic manner, adopting new attitudes, modulating cognitive biases and behavioral responses (Bertrand et al., 2018).

EVR have shown promising effects on increasing altruistic intentions and self-compassion (Rosenberg et al., 2013; Falconer et al., 2016). It has also proved useful in reducing short term implicit racial bias (Peck et al., 2013; Banakou et al., 2016). Recent experiments have shown that EVR can be used to alter behavior of aggressive populations (Seinfeld et al., 2018). After experiencing the perspective of a female victim of domestic abuses, offenders developed higher ability to recognize fearful female faces, reducing their bias of identifying fearful female faces of happy. Combined to biofeedback mechanisms these may offer powerful tool to study and modulate empathy in a clinical setting.

One of such embodiment systems is The Machine To Be Another (TMBA). This EVR has been widely presented in various artistic venues and uses different setups to allow two persons to exchange bodies in real time (Bertrand et al., 2014, 2018; Sutherland, 2014; Oliveira et al., 2016), and to allow users to experience the perspective and personal narrative of another human subject (Souppouris, 2014; Martín, 2016; Aragão, 2017). By allowing the use of real human individuals as characters to be embodied, TMBA has been applied to address issues in several contexts of prejudices, allowing a wide variety of users to experience the daily lives of migrants in Europe, muslims suffering prejudice, exiled individuals seeking asylum, and victims of military forces. TMBA has been used as a tool to bridge the gap between cultures, ideologies and backgrounds, aiming to expand individual's empathy toward actual human

229 beings often considered outgroups, and to foster compassion (see  
230 Bertrand et al., 2018).

231 The current democratization of VR due to a greater access in  
232 technology allows the development of highly scalable therapeutic  
233 and educational methods for helping subjects develop positive  
234 emotional states and pro-social behavior. In the final section we  
235 present a proof of concept of how such EVR could serve to trigger  
236 more specific social emotions and their psychophysiological  
237 effects on mind and behavior in clinical and typical populations.  
238

## 239 240 SENSOR-ACTUATOR SYSTEM TO 241 CONTROL SOCIAL EMOTIONS

242 Technologists attempting to control emotions in human  
243 populations to foster altruism can either study the needs  
244 and conflicts of such populations, or target specific social  
245 emotions and their effect on human altruism. One of such social  
246 emotions is aesthetic chills or psychogenic shivers (goosebumps,  
247 gooseflesh, chills, thrills). In this section, we review the devices  
248 attempting to control this emotion and its psychological effects  
249 in humans.

250 Psychogenic shivering (PS) has received considerable  
251 attention due to the fact that it is conscious, measurable and  
252 universal (Pelowski et al., 2018; Schoeller et al., 2018b). Shivers  
253 are a small muscle tremor ordinarily involved in the regulation  
254 of body temperature (Haman and Blondin, 2017). Yet humans  
255 sometimes shiver independently of any changes in temperature  
256 (Schoeller, 2015a). Here, we refer to this event as psychogenic  
257 shivering (PS). Psychogenic shivers are most often triggered by  
258 music and film, but can also occur in the course of scientific  
259 or religious practices (Schoeller, 2015b). What is of particular  
260 interest to this article is the fact that humans often shiver  
261 in reaction to specific social situations (Schurtz et al., 2011;  
262 Schoeller et al., 2018b) and that PS inducing music has been  
263 found to enhance altruism (Fukui and Toyoshima, 2014).  
264 It is interesting to note that other primates (most notably  
265 chimpanzees) also show signs of psychogenic shivering in the  
266 course of bluff display (Aureli and de Waal, 1977). One striking  
267 property of situations provoking PS in humans is their social  
268 dimension (e.g., Keltner and Haidt, 2003). Humans shiver in  
269 groups, specifically when the group shares a common goal and  
270 when each member of the group focuses its attention on the  
271 evolution of context in light of the goal (in a football stadium  
272 for example, or in a public manifestation). PS can be elicited by  
273 music (Blood and Zatorre, 2001), films (Schoeller and Perlovsky,  
274 2016), science (Cronin and Greenwood, 1982; Schoeller, 2015b),  
275 religious ceremonies (Inbody, 2015; Schoeller, 2015b), social  
276 situations. Interestingly, in all these domains, negative PS related  
277 to fear and lack of information can be observed as well (Halpern  
278 et al., 1986; Zald and Pardo, 2002).

279 In past decades various technological projects have been  
280 involved in the control of PS. Teams have been interested in  
281 measuring (Kim et al., 2014), controlling (Jain, Horowitz and  
282 Schoeller), or incorporating PS in VR (Neidlinger K. et al.,  
283 2017; Neidlinger K. L. et al., 2017; Quesnel and Riecke, 2017,  
284 2018; Quesnel et al., 2018). An important questions, currently

285 beyond measurement, is whether the amount of heat related to  
286 specific emotions can be predicted effectively (Schoeller et al.,  
287 2018a), that is whether the psychogenic shivers serves any  
288 evolutionary function (Tihanyi et al., 2018). Progress toward  
289 answering this question could help better understand the neural  
290 networks underlying human social emotions and their biological  
291 importance in humans (Dunbar, 2009).

292 There have been several attempts to control the generation  
293 of PS through actuators (e.g., Neidlinger K. et al., 2017;  
294 Neidlinger K. L. et al., 2017). An ongoing collaboration  
295 amongst the authors involves the creation of a wearable chill-  
296 actuator device designed to create artificial chills and shivers.  
297 Currently, the device form factor includes a custom circuit  
298 board, a vibrating motor disc, and a peltier thermoelectric  
299 cooler housed in a body-fitted photopolymer resin case. This  
300 form factor allows for concurrent delivery of sudden cooling  
301 temperature and concentrated vibration on the upper back  
302 of participants, where organic PS typically begin, to initiate  
303 artificial shivers. The device is tied to a custom Android  
304 application and can be triggered wirelessly and remotely,  
305 allowing for single or multiple networked devices to deliver chills  
306 at predefined moments during songs or videos which subjects are  
307 viewing.

308 Past research has elucidated the correlations between PS  
309 and many metrics relevant to the generation of empathy,  
310 including levels of openness to experience, awe, and perceived  
311 meaningfulness of a situation (e.g., McCrae, 2007; Schurtz et al.,  
312 2011; Fayn et al., 2017; Quesnel et al., 2018; Schoeller et al.,  
313 2018b). Devices such as the PS actuator thus allow future testing  
314 of whether these correlational relationships previously seen are  
315 also causal, allowing for the generation of greater openness  
316 to experience through generation of artificially induced chills  
317 (Schoeller and Perlovsky, 2015). If validated, this would allow  
318 researchers to induce and maximize social emotions through  
319 bodily actuators at a distance.

## 322 CONCLUSION

323 Different technological approaches, from biofeedback signals to  
324 embodied virtual reality and psychophysiological actuators, have  
325 been used to support the enhancement of human empathic  
326 abilities. The complementary nature of these stimuli regarding  
327 the different effects they may trigger lead us to reflect on the  
328 possible combination of these technologies to produce even more  
329 effective responses. For example, heart-rate biofeedback has been  
330 shown effective in enhancing embodiment (Aspell et al., 2013;  
331 Suzuki et al., 2013), but as previously discussed could also be  
332 used to enhance emotion regulation, an important aspect of  
333 avoiding empathic distress. One can envision a system combining  
334 both stimuli to help users to step into the shoes of a distressed  
335 individual while training for compassion. In the same way, VR  
336 could be used to offer immersive neurofeedback environments  
337 and help develop fine grained awareness of one's own empathic  
338 arousal and cognitive engagement. VR and PS could be combined  
339 to create social situations and shared goals for networked users in  
340 immersive environments.

In order to increase a sense of shared goals in VR, a chill-actuator device could be incorporated in such situations, increasing the likelihood of PS and theoretically increasing correlated social emotions such as shared group identity or synchronicity. The design of chill-elicit VR stimuli, and the incorporation of chill-actuator devices into existing empathy related VR experiences such as TMBA, offer unique avenues for the study and generation of empathy and the physiological underpinnings of social emotions. Although

further research is required to properly explore the effects of integrating these technologies, the development of new systems of empathic abilities reveals to be a promising field for positive technologies.

## AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

All authors listed have made a substantial, direct and intellectual contribution to the work, and approved it for publication.

## REFERENCES

- Aragão, C. (2017). *News Festa Literária das Periferias e filme de Oliver Stone são destaques culturais da semana*. GloboNews. Available online at: <http://g1.globo.com/globo-news/jornal-globo-news/videos/t/videos/v/festa-literaria-das-periferias-e-filme-de-oliver-stone-sao-destaques-culturais-da-semana/5443787/> (Accessed October 31, 2017).
- Aspell, J. E., Heydrich, L., Marillier, G., Lavanchy, T., Herbelin, B., and Blanke, O. (2013). Turning body and self inside out. Visualized heartbeats alter bodily self-consciousness and tactile perception. *Psychol. Sci.* 24, 2445–2453. doi: 10.1177/0956797613498395
- Aureli, F., and de Waal, F. B. (1977). Inhibition of social behavior in chimpanzees under high-density conditions. *Am. J. Primatol.* 41, 213–228. doi: 10.1002/(SICI)1098-2345(1997)41:3<213::AID-AJP4>3.0.CO;2-#
- Azevedo, R. T., Bennett, N., Bilicki, A., Hooper, J., Markopoulou, F., and Tsakiris, M. (2017). The calming effect of a new wearable device during the anticipation of public speech. *Sci. Rep.* 7:2285. doi: 10.1038/s41598-017-02274-2
- Banakou, D., Hanumanthu, P. D., and Slater, M. (2016). Virtual embodiment of white people in a black virtual body leads to a sustained reduction in their implicit racial bias. *Front. Hum. Neurosci.* 10:601. doi: 10.3389/fnhum.2016.00601
- Banakou, D., Kishore, S., and Slater, M. (2018). Virtually being einstein results in an improvement in cognitive task performance and a decrease in age bias. *Front. Psychol.* 11:917. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2018.00917
- Bertrand, P., González-Franco, D., Pointeau, A., and Cherene, C. (2014). “The machine to be another - embodied telepresence using human performers - work in progress demo,” in *TEI Conference 2014* (Munich).
- Bertrand, P., Guegan, J., Robieux, L., McCall, C. A., and Zenasni, F. (2018). Learning empathy through virtual reality: multiple strategies for training empathy-related abilities using body ownership illusions in embodied virtual reality. *Front. Robot. AI* 5:26. doi: 10.3389/frobt.2018.00026
- Blandon, D. Z., Munoz, J. E., Lopez, D. S., and Gallo, O. H. (2016). “Influence of a BCI neurofeedback videogame in children with ADHD: Quantifying the brain activity through an EEG signal processing dedicated toolbox,” in *2016 IEEE 11th Colombian Computing Conference (CCC)*.
- Blood, A. J., and Zatorre, R. J. (2001). Intensely pleasurable responses to music correlate with activity in brain regions implicated in reward and emotion. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* 98, 11818–11823. doi: 10.1073/pnas.191355898
- Botvinick, M., and Cohen, J. (1998). Rubber hands “feel” touch that eyes see. *Nature* 391:756.
- Carson, J. W., Keefe, F. J., Lynch, T. R., Carson, K. M., Goli, V., Fras, A. M., et al. (2005). Loving-kindness meditation for chronic low back pain. *J Holist. Nurs.* 23, 287–304. doi: 10.1177/0898010105277651
- Cavazza, M., Aranyi, G., Charles, F., Porteous, J., Gilroy, S. W., Klovatch, I., et al. (2014). “Towards empathic neurofeedback for interactive storytelling,” in *Proceedings of 2014 Workshop on Computational Models of Narrative (CMN 2014)*, (Quebec City, QC).
- Cronin, J. W., and Greenwood, M. S. (1982). Cp symmetry violation. *Phys. Today* 35, 38–44. doi: 10.1063/1.2915169
- Davidson, R. J., Ekman, P., Saron, C. D., Senulis, J. A., and Friesen, W. V. (1990). Approach-withdrawal and cerebral asymmetry: emotional expression and brain physiology I. *J. Pers Soc. Psychol.* 58, 330–341. doi: 10.1037/0022-3514.58.2.330
- de Vignemont, F., and Singer, T. (2006). The empathetic brain: how, when and why? *Trends Cogn. Sci.* 10, 435–441. doi: 10.1016/j.tics.2006.08.008
- Decety, J. (2010). The neurodevelopment of empathy in humans. *Dev. Neurosci.* 32, 257–267. doi: 10.1159/000317771
- Decety, J., and Meyer, M. (2008). From emotion resonance to empathic understanding: a social developmental neuroscience account. *Dev. Psychopathol.* 20, 1053–1080. doi: 10.1017/S0954579408000503
- Dunbar, R. I. (2009). The social brain hypothesis and its implications for social evolution. *Ann. Hum. Biol.* 36, 562–572. doi: 10.1080/03014460902960289
- Falconer, C., Rovira, A., King, J., Gilbert, P., Antley, A., Fearon, P., et al. (2016). Embodying self-compassion within virtual reality and its effects on patients with depression. *BJPsych Open* 2, 74–80. doi: 10.1192/bjpo.bp.115.002147
- Fayn, K., Silvia, P. J., Erbas, Y., Tiliopoulos, N., and Kuppens, P. (2017). Nuanced aesthetic emotions: emotion differentiation is related to knowledge of the arts and curiosity. *Cogn. Emot.* 32, 593–599. doi: 10.1080/02699931.2017.1322554
- Fukui, H., and Toyoshima, K. (2014). Chill-inducing music enhances altruism in humans. *Front. Psychol.* 5:1215. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2014.01215
- Gilbert, P., and Procter, S. (2006). Compassionate mind training for people with high shame and self-criticism: overview and pilot study of a group therapy approach. *Clin. Psychol. Psychother.* 13, 353–379. doi: 10.1002/cpp.507
- Halpern, D. L., Blake, R., and Hillenbrand, J. (1986). Psychoacoustics of a chilling sound. *Percept. Psychophys.* 39, 77–80. doi: 10.3758/BF03211488
- Haman, F., and Blondin, D. P. (2017). Shivering thermogenesis in humans: origin, contribution and metabolic requirement. *Temperature* 4, 217–226. doi: 10.1080/23328940.2017.1328999
- Heatherton, T. F., Wyland, C. L., Macrae, C. N., Demos, K. E., Denny, B. T., and Kelley, W. M. (2006). Medial prefrontal activity differentiates self from close others. *Soc. Cogn. Affect. Neurosci.* 1, 18–25. doi: 10.1093/scan/nsl001
- Hojat, M., Vergare, M. J., Maxwell, K., Brainard, G., Herrine, S. K., Isenberg, G. A., et al. (2009). The devil is in the third year: a longitudinal study of erosion of empathy in medical school. *Acad. Med.* 84, 1182–1191. doi: 10.1097/ACM.0b013e3181b17e55
- Inbody, J. (2015). Sensing God: bodily manifestations and their interpretation in Pentecostal rituals and everyday life. *Social. Religion* 76, 337–355. doi: 10.1093/socrel/srv032
- Keltner, D., and Haidt, J. (2003). Approaching awe, a moral, spiritual, and aesthetic emotion. *Cogn. Emot.* 297–314. doi: 10.1080/02699930302297
- Kim, J., Seo, D. G., and Choa, Y.-H. (2014). A flexible skin piloerection monitoring sensor. *Appl. Phys. Lett.* 104:253502. doi: 10.1063/1.4881888
- Klich, U. (2015). The integration of mindfulness-based biofeedback and compassion in the healthcare setting. *Biofeedback* 43, 111–116. doi: 10.5298/1081-5937-43.3.07
- Klimecki, O. M., Leiberg, S., Lamm, C., and Singer, T. (2013). Functional neural plasticity and associated changes in positive affect after compassion training. *Cereb. Cortex* 23, 1552–1561. doi: 10.1093/cercor/bhs142
- Klimecki, O. M., Leiberg, S., Ricard, M., and Singer, T. (2014). Differential pattern of functional brain plasticity after compassion and empathy training. *Soc. Cogn. Affect. Neurosci.* 7, 873–879. doi: 10.1093/scan/nst060
- Lutz, A., Slagter, H. A., Dunne, J. D., and Davidson, R. J. (2008). Attention regulation and monitoring in meditation. *Trends Cogn. Sci.* 12, 163–169. doi: 10.1016/j.tics.2008.01.005
- Martin, M. (2016). *Tribuna | A máquina que me converteu em um garoto da Cidade de Deus; por María Martín*. EL PAÍS. Available online at: [https://brasil.elpais.com/brasil/2016/11/14/politica/1479132694\\_581507.html](https://brasil.elpais.com/brasil/2016/11/14/politica/1479132694_581507.html) (Accessed October 31, 2017).

- 457 Maselli, A., and Slater, M. (2013). The building blocks of the full body ownership  
458 illusion. *Front. Hum. Neurosci.* 7:83. doi: 10.3389/fnhum.2013.00083
- 459 McCall, C., and Singer, T. (2013). *Empathy and the Brain. Baron-Cohen et al Understanding Other Minds: Perspectives from Developmental Social Neuroscience*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- 460 McCrae, R. R. (2007). Aesthetic chills as a universal marker of openness to  
461 experience. *Motiv. Emot.* 31, 5–11. doi: 10.1007/s11031-007-9053-1
- 462 Myszkowski, N., Brunet-Gouet, E., Roux, P., Robieux, L., Malézieux, A., Boujut,  
463 E., et al. (2017). Is the Questionnaire of Cognitive and Affective Empathy  
464 measuring two or five dimensions? Evidence in a French sample. *Psychiatry Res.* 255, 292–296. doi: 10.1016/j.psychres.2017.05.047
- 465 Neidlinger, K., Truong, K. P., Telfair, C., Feijs, L., Dertien, E., and Evers, V. (2017).  
466 “AWElectric,” in *Proceedings of the Tenth International Conference on Tangible,  
467 Embedded, and Embodied Interaction - TEI’17* (ACM Press).
- 468 Neidlinger, K. L., Truong, K. P., Telfair, C., Feijs, L., Dertien, E. C., and Evers,  
469 V. (2017). “AWElectric: that gave me goosebumps, did you feel it too?”, in  
470 *Proceedings of the Eleventh International Conference on Tangible, Embedded,  
471 and Embodied Interaction*.
- 472 Oliveira, E. C. D., Bertrand, P., Lesur, M. E. R., Palomo, P., Demarzo, M., Cebolla,  
473 A., et al. (eds.). (2016). “Virtual body swap: a new feasible tool to be explored  
474 in health and education,” in *2016 XVIII Symposium on Virtual and Augmented  
475 Reality (SVR)*, 81–89.
- 476 Osimo, S. A., Pizarro, R., Spanlang, B., and Slater, M. (2015). Conversations  
477 between self and self as Sigmund Freud,—A, virtual body ownership paradigm  
478 for self counselling. *Sci. Rep.* 5:13899. doi: 10.1038/srep13899
- 479 Pace, T. W., Negi, L. T., Adame, D. D., Cole, S. P., Sivilli, T. I., Brown, T. D., et al.  
480 Raison, C. L. (2009). Effect of compassion meditation on neuroendocrine,  
481 innate immune and behavioral responses to psychosocial stress.  
*Psychoneuroendocrinology* 34, 87–98. doi: 10.1016/j.psyneuen.2008.08.011
- 482 Peck, T. C., Seinfeld, S., Aglioti, S. M., and Slater, M. (2013). Putting yourself in the  
483 skin of a black avatar reduces implicit racial bias. *Conscious. Cogn.* 22, 779–787.  
doi: 10.1016/j.concog.2013.04.016
- 484 Pelowski, M., Markey, P., and Leder, H. (2018). Chills, aesthetic experience, and  
485 new versus old knowledge — What do chills actually portend? *Phys. Life Rev.*  
486 25, 83–87. doi: 10.1016/j.plrev.2018.03.014
- 487 Quesnel, D., DiPaola, S., and Riecke, B. (2018). “Deep learning for classification  
488 of peak emotions within virtual reality systems,” in *International SERIES On  
489 Information Systems And Management In Creative EMedia (CreMedia)*, 6–11.
- 490 Quesnel, D., and Riecke, B. E. (2017). *Awestruck: Natural Interaction With Virtual  
491 Reality on Eliciting Awe*. Piscataway, NJ: IEEE.
- 492 Quesnel, D., and Riecke, B. E. (2018). Are you awed yet? How virtual reality gives  
493 us awe and goose bumps. *Front. Psychol.* 9:2158. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2018.02158
- 494 Reniers, R. L., Corcoran, R., Drake, R., Shryane, N. M., and Vollm, B. A. (2011).  
The QCAE: a questionnaire of cognitive and affective empathy. *J. Pers. Assess.*  
495 93, 84–95. doi: 10.1080/00223891.2010.528484
- 496 Rosenberg, R. S., Baughman, S. L., and Bailenson, J. (2013). Virtual superheroes:  
497 using superpowers in virtual reality to encourage prosocial behavior. *PLoS ONE*  
498 8:e55003. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0055003
- 499 Schoeller, F. (2015a). Knowledge, curiosity, and aesthetic chills. *Front. Psychol.*  
500 6:1546. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2015.01546
- 501 Schoeller, F. (2015b). The shivers of knowledge. *Hum. Soc. Stud.* 4 26–41.  
doi: 10.1515/hssr-2015-0022
- 502 Schoeller, F., Eskinazi, M., and Garreau, M. (2018a). Dynamics of the knowledge  
503 instinct: Effects of incoherence on the cognitive system. *Cogn. Syst. Res.* 47  
504 85–91. doi: 10.1016/j.cogsys.2017.07.005
- 505 Schoeller, F., and Perlovsky, L. (2015). Great Expectations: narratives  
506 and the elicitation of aesthetic chills. *Psychology* 6, 2098–2102.  
doi: 10.4236/psych.2015.616205
- 507 Schoeller, F., and Perlovsky, L. (2016). Aesthetic Chills: Knowledge-Acquisition,  
508 Meaning-Making, and Aesthetic Emotions. *Front. Psychol.* 7:1093.  
doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2016.01093
- 509 Schoeller, F., Perlovsky, L., and Arseniev, D. (2018b). Physics of mind:  
510 experimental confirmations of theoretical predictions. *Phys. Life Rev.* 25, 45–68.  
doi: 10.1016/j.plrev.2017.11.021
- 511 Schurtz, D. R., Blincoe, S., Smith, R. H., Powell, A. J., Combs, D. J. Y., and  
512 Kim, S. H. (2011). Exploring the social aspects of goose bumps and their  
513 role in awe and envy. *Motiv. Emot.* 36, 205–217. doi: 10.1007/s11031-011-  
514 9243-8
- 515 Seinfeld, S., Arroyo-Palacios, J., Iruretagoyena, G., Hortensius, R., Zapata, L. E.,  
516 Borland, D., et al. (2018). Offenders become the victim in virtual reality:  
517 impact of changing perspective in domestic violence. *Sci. Rep.* 8:2692.  
doi: 10.1038/s41598-018-19987-7
- 518 Singer, T., and Lamm, C. (2009). The social neuroscience of empathy. *Ann. N.Y.  
519 Acad. Sci.* 1156, 81–96. doi: 10.1111/j.1749-6632.2009.04418.x
- 520 Souppouris, A. (2014). *Virtual Reality Made Me Believe I Was Someone Else*.  
521 The Verge. Available online at: <https://www.theverge.com/2014/3/24/5526694/virtual-reality-made-me-believe-i-was-someone-else> (Accessed October 31,  
522 2017).
- 523 Sutherland, A. (2014). *The Limits of Virtual Reality: Debugging the Empathy  
524 Machine MIT – Docubase*. Available online at: <https://docubase.mit.edu/lab/case-studies/the-limits-of-virtual-reality-debugging-the-empathy-machine/>  
525 (Accessed October 31, 2017).
- 526 Suzuki, K., Garfinkel, S. N., Critchley, H. D., and Seth, A. K. (2013). Multisensory  
527 integration across exteroceptive and interoceptive domains modulates self-  
528 experience in the rubber-hand illusion. *Neuropsychologia* 51, 2909–2917.  
doi: 10.1016/j.neuropsychologia.2013.08.014
- 529 Tihanyi, B. T., Eszter, F., Florian, B., and Köteles, F. (2018). The  
530 neuropsychophysiology of tingling. *Conscious. Cogn.* 58, 97–110.  
doi: 10.1016/j.concog.2017.10.015
- 531 Vourvopoulos, A., Badia, B. S., and Liarokapis, F. (2017). EEG correlates of  
532 video game experience and user profile in motor-imagery-based brain-  
533 computer interaction. *Vis. Comput.* 33:533. doi: 10.1007/s00371-016-  
534 1304-2
- 535 Yee, N., and Bailenson, J. (2007). The proteus effect: the effect of transformed  
536 self-representation on behavior. *Hum. Commun. Res.* 33, 271–290.  
doi: 10.1111/j.1468-2958.2007.00299.x
- 537 Zald, D. H., and Pardo, J. V. (2002). The neural correlates of aversive auditory  
538 stimulation. *NeuroImage* 16, 746–753. doi: 10.1006/nimg.2002.1115
- 539
- 540 **Conflict of Interest Statement:** The authors declare that the research was  
541 conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could  
542 be construed as a potential conflict of interest.
- 543
- 544 Copyright © 2019 Schoeller, Bertrand, Gerry, Jain, Horowitz and Zenasni. This is an  
545 open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution  
546 License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted,  
547 provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the  
548 original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic  
549 practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply  
550 with these terms.
- 551
- 552
- 553
- 554
- 555
- 556
- 557
- 558
- 559
- 560
- 561
- 562
- 563
- 564
- 565
- 566
- 567
- 568
- 569
- 570