Verticillium dahliae Disease Resistance and the Regulatory Pathway for Maturity and Tuberization in Potato

Helen H. Tai,* David De Koeyer, Mads Sønderkær, Sanne Hedegaard, Martin Lagüe, Claudia Goyer, Lana Nolan, Charlotte Davidson, Kyle Gardner, Jonathan Neilson, Jamuna Risal Paudel, Agnes Murphy, Benoit Bizimungu, Hui Ying Wang, Xingyao Xiong, Dennis Halterman, and Kåre Lehmann Nielsen

ABSTRACT
Verticillium dahliae Kleb. is a pathogenic fungus causing wilting, chlorosis, and early dying in potato (Solanum tuberosum L.). Genetic mapping of resistance to V. dahliae was done using a diploid population of potato. The major quantitative trait locus (QTL) for Verticillium resistance was found on chromosome 5. The StCDF1 gene, controlling earliness of maturity and tuberization, was mapped within the interval. Another QTL on chromosome 9 co-localized with the Ve2 Verticillium wilt resistance gene marker. Epistasis analysis indicated that the loci on chromosomes 5 and 9 had a highly significant interaction, and that StCDF1 functioned downstream of Ve2. The StCDF1 alleles were sequenced and found to encode StCDF1.1 and StCDF1.3. Interaction between the Ve2 resistance allele and the StCDF1.3 was demonstrated, but not for StCDF1.1. Genome-wide expression QTL (eQTL) analysis was performed and genes with eQTL at the StCDF1 and Ve2 loci were both found to have similar functions involving the chloroplast, including photosynthesis, which declines in both maturity and Verticillium wilt. Among the gene ontology (GO) terms that were specific to genes with eQTL at the Ve2, but not the StCDF1 locus, were those associated with fungal defense. These results suggest that Ve2 controls fungal defense and reduces early dying in Verticillium wilt through affecting genetic pathway controlling tuberization timing.

Core Ideas
• Verticillium wilt resistance is linked to control of tuberization in potato.
• The StCDF1 tuberization gene is epistatic to the Ve2 resistance gene.
• eQTL can be used to examine gene networks for complex traits.

Verticillium wilt is caused by fungal colonization of the vascular system in plants (Johnson and Dung, 2010; Pegg and Brady, 2002) and is primarily a problem in temperate regions with decreased incidence in the tropics. Verticillium dahliae is the species with the greatest economic impact as a result of its broad...
host range, including potato (Inderbitzin et al., 2011). Blockage of the xylem occurs with infection reducing the flow of water and nutrients, which is associated with wilting and chlorosis (Fradin and Thomma, 2006). Defense responses in the plant include production of tyloses in the xylem to block the flow of conidia and production of antifungal defense compounds and enzymes (Beckman, 1964; Daayf, 2015; Talboys, 1972; Yadeta and Thomma, 2013). In potato, *Verticillium* infection also induces early vine maturity (Rowe and Powelson, 2002). Potato vine maturity is a form of whole plant senescence, which is coordinated with production of tubers (Davies and Gan, 2012; Ewing and Struik, 1992; Wohleb et al., 2014). *Verticillium*-induced early vine maturity results in smaller vines with reduced resources available for transfer to tubers leading to significantly decreased yields (Rowe and Powelson, 2002).

Tubers develop from modified underground stems called stolons. Under inductive conditions, stolon tips will undergo swelling to form tubers (Ewing and Struik, 1992). Andean varieties, such as *S. tuberosum* spp. *andigena*, and wild potato species are strictly dependent on short days for tuberization; however, *S. tuberosum* spp. *tuberosum*, derived from Chilean landraces, has the capacity to tuberize under long days (Rodriguez-Falcon et al., 2006). Grafting studies showed that short-day (long-night) length is sensed in the leaves followed by transport of mobile signals to the stolons (Chapman, 1958; Gregory, 1956). Recent studies show photoperiod control of the timing of tuberization by potato orthologs of flowering time regulators (Hannapel et al., 2017; Rodriguez-Falcon et al., 2006). CONSTANS (CO) in Arabidopsis thaliana is involved in promoting flowering under long days through regulation of expression of *flowering locus T* (*FT*) (Shim et al., 2017; Turck et al., 2008). The FT protein is a mobile florigen produced in leaves in response to long days and mobilized to floral meristems. In potato, conversely, CO suppresses tuberization under long days in *S. tuberosum* spp. *andigena* (González-Schain et al., 2012; Martínez-García et al., 2002). The potato FT ortholog, *StSP6A*, was found to be a mobile tuberigen in response to short daylengths (Navarro et al., 2011). In the regulatory pathway upstream, another FT-like gene, *StSP5G*, is a negative regulator of *StSP6A* gene expression, but the mechanism of repression is not known (Abelenda et al., 2016). The potato CO orthologs, *StCOL1* and 2, activate transcription of *StSP5G* in response to short days (Abelenda et al., 2016).

The *CDF1* transcriptional repressor downregulates expression of *CO* in *A. thaliana*, which results in a delay of flowering (Fornara et al., 2009). *CDF1* is targeted for degradation by the light-dependent interaction of GIGANTEA (*GI*) and FLAVIN-BINDING, KELCH REPEAT, F-BOX1 (*FKF1*) to promote flowering (Imaizumi et al., 2005; Sawa et al., 2007). The potato ortholog, *StCDF1*, is similarly targeted for protein degradation under noninductive long days by the light-dependent interaction of potato orthologs of *GI* and *FKF1*; however, the result is to delay tuberization (Klooosterman et al., 2013). This interaction is lost under tuber-inducing short-day conditions resulting in increased *StCDF1* protein levels and downstream signaling of increased *StSP6A* in stolons leading to tuberization. Potato clones demonstrating early maturity and tuberization under long days were found to carry variants of the *StCDF1*, *StCDF1.2*, and *StCDF1.3*, encoding truncated proteins missing domains for interaction of FKF1 (Klooosterman et al., 2013; Morris et al., 2014). These studies show the importance of *StCDF1* in determining maturity and tuberization timing.

Tuberization is also regulated by BEL1-like transcription factors, which function together with KNOX-type transcription factors to regulate growth and development in plants (Hannapel et al., 2017). The potato *BEL1* gene, *StBEL5*, was also found to function as a mobile signal for tuberization, where the transcript was mobilized from the leaves to the stolons under short-day conditions (Banerjee et al., 2006; Chen et al., 2003). Studies have also shown that *StBEL5* upregulates *StCDF1* and *StSP6A* gene expression ( Sharma et al., 2016). In addition, CO in potato was found to be a repressor of *StBEL5* expression (González-Schain et al., 2012). Other members of the BEL family, *StBEL11*, and *StBEL29*, were also found to express transcripts that mobilized from leaves to stolons under short days. These genes were antagonistic to *StBEL5* (Ghate et al., 2017) and were postulated to function in an activator/inhibitor module that fine-tunes tuber growth.

*Flowering locus T* has also emerged as an integrator of multiple signals for flowering (Pin and Nilsson, 2012). In *A. thaliana*, *Fusarium oxysporum* colonization of the xylem induces vascular wilt similar to *Verticillium*. Infection was also found to accelerate flowering time through regulating transcription of flowering time genes, *flowering locus C* (*FLC*), *FT*, and *GI* (Lyons et al., 2015). Accelerated flowering was observed with infection of *A. thaliana* with leaf colonizing pathogens *Pseudomonas syringae*, *Xanthomonas campestris*, and *Peronospora parasitica* (Korves and Bergelson, 2003). Furthermore, the salicylic acid (SA) regulator gene, *WIN3*, was found to confer resistance to *P. syringae* and *Botrytis cinerea* in concert with other SA regulators, in addition to affecting flowering regulators *FLC* and *FT* (Wang et al., 2011). Induction of early flowering or tuberization in the infected plant allows for reproduction before the pathogen kills the plant entirely. The trade-off for accelerated development is decreased production of fruits, seeds, and tubers (Rowe and Powelson, 2002; Su et al., 2013).

In tomato (*Solanum lycopersicum* L.), QTL mapping of *Verticillium* wilt disease resistance led to identification of a single dominant locus, *Ve*, on chromosome 9 (Diwan et al., 1999). Race 1 of *V. dahliae* and *V. albo-atrum* pathogens are effectively mitigated by the *Ve* locus, but not race 2. Positional cloning of the tomato *Ve* locus identified two tandemly located, closely related genes encoding leucine-rich repeat cell surface receptors, *Ve1* and *Ve2* (Kawchuk et al., 2001). Potato orthologs of *Ve1* and *Ve2*
were cloned using polymerase chain reaction (PCR) and were demonstrated in diploid potato clones to map to chromosome 9 in a region corresponding to the location of Ve in tomato (Simko et al., 2003). Additionally, linkage disequilibrium mapping of tetraploid potato clones demonstrated that V. dahliae and V. albo-atrum resistance was associated with a marker that was closely linked to the ortholog of Ve1 (Simko et al., 2004a, 2004b).

Wild Solanum species were found to be sources of Verticillium resistance and have been introgressed to S. tuberosum in potato breeding programs (Concibido et al., 1994; Corsini and Pavè, 1996; Corsini et al., 1988; Jansky and Rouse, 2000; Jansky et al., 2004; Lynch et al., 1997; Simko et al., 2004c). Development of markers to predict resistance to Verticillium wilt has involved PCR of the region conserved between Ve1 and Ve2 to clone orthologous Ve genes from several resistant wild Solanum species (Bae et al., 2008; Uribe et al., 2014). The cloned genes from the wild species were found to have high sequence identity with Ve2. The diploid potato clone 12120-03 was found to be heterozygous for a Ve2 resistance allele and had low levels of V. dahliae pathogen and mild symptoms after infection (Tai et al., 2013). Another diploid potato clone, 07506-01, was homozygous null for Ve2 resistance alleles; however, this clone did not develop symptoms even after high levels of V. dahliae were found after infection (Tai et al., 2013). These results suggested that 07506–01 had tolerance to V. dahliae.

The expression of genes can also be genetically mapped as eQTL (Druka et al., 2010; Holloway and Li, 2010). The eQTL loci control the expression of the genes either in cis (local regulation) or in trans (located at distant locations). The eQTL analysis was used to understand the genetic architecture underlying partial resistance to Puccinia hordei in barley (Chen et al., 2010) and diverse biological processes in tomato (Ranjan et al., 2016). To better understand the genetics underlying V. dahliae disease resistance, genetic mapping of the trait and eQTL was done using a biparental cross population derived from 12120-03 and 07506-01. The objective of the study was to identify gene networks involved in V. dahliae disease resistance in potato.

Materials and Methods

Plant Materials

Diploid potato clone 12120-03 was used as a female parent in a cross with male diploid parent 07506-01 to generate a F1 mapping population (15143) consisting of 91 clones. The male parent, 07506-01, was derived from pollination of W9306.2, with bulked pollen from 2 x hybrids. The female parental clone, 12120-03 was derived from a cross between 09113 and 11 x 09753-01. The pedigree of both parental clones contains S. phureja and S. stenotomum. Disease-free seed tuber stocks of the potato clones were propagated in the field and maintained at the Benton-Ridge Substation of Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada in Benton, New Brunswick, Canada. The seed tubers from the clones were planted in an experimental field (45°52’ N, 66°31’ W) containing V. dahliae at the Fredericton Research and Development Centre of Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada in Fredericton, New Brunswick, Canada, on 22 May 2009. Planting in Fredericton was done in a randomized complete block design with three replicate plots of five hills (i.e., plants). Fertilizer was banded about 7.5 cm to each side and 5 cm below the potato seed pieces at planting according to normal production practices at 200 kg N ha⁻¹ as ammonium nitrate, 150 kg P₂O₅ ha⁻¹, and 150 kg K₂O ha⁻¹. The plants were killed in mid-July. Standard commercial practices were used for control of diseases, insects, and weeds. No irrigation was applied. The variety Green Mountain was planted in guard rows flanking the plot, every third row, and at the ends of each row. Green Mountain was tested for presence of V. dahliae at locations throughout the plot to confirm presence of the pathogen. Stem cuttings of Green Mountain plants were taken at the base of the stem and surfaced sterilized in 10% bleach, 70% ethanol, and 0.05% Tween 20 (Sigma-Aldrich, Oakville, Canada). Slices of sterilized stems (0.5 cm wide) were cut and placed on a sterile potato dextrose agar (Sigma-Aldrich, Oakville, Canada) in 10 cm Petri dishes for 1 to 2 wk at 20°C. Identification of V. dahliae cultures was based on visual characteristics.

The smallest leaflet of the fourth leaf from the top of the plant was sampled for ribonucleic acid (RNA) extraction from each of the five plants in each replicate plot 52 d after planting (DAP) for RNA extraction. The leaflets for each replicate were combined in a single 2 mL tube containing lysing matrix D (MP Biomedicals, Solon, OH) and immediately flash frozen in liquid nitrogen in the field. Frozen leaf material was stored at −80°C until processed.

Disease Resistance Scoring

Disease resistance was scored at 100 DAP. Visual scoring of disease resistance was done using an index from 1 to 9, where 1 was a dead plant and 9 was a fully upright healthy plant. Leaf yellowing, leaf loss, and wilting would result in lowered scores. The least squares (LS) mean of the disease resistance score was used for MapQTL analysis.

RNA Extraction

Leaf tissue was ground in the Lysing Matrix D tubes using a Geno Grinder 2000 (SPEX CertiPrep) machine for 2 min at speed 5. Samples were kept frozen. One mL RNA lysis buffer [200 mM sodium borate decahydrate (Borax), pH 9.0, 30 mM ethylene glycol bis(β-aminoethyl ether)-N’-tetraacetic acid, 1% (w/v) sodium dodecyl sulfate, and 10 mM dithiothreitol] plus 1% (w/v) sodium deoxycholate and 2% (w/v) polyvinylpyrrolidone (avg. molecular weight of 40,000; Luo et al., 2011; Wan and Wilkins, 1994) was added to ground leaf tissue in each tube. The lysate was mixed using a vortexer and centrifuged briefly at 10,000 x g for 5 min to pellet debris. Lysate supernatant (200 μL) was used for RNA extraction using the Agencourt RNAAdvace Tissue Kit (Beckman)
Deep Serial Analysis of Gene Expression

Two micrograms of total RNA per sample was used to construct deep serial analysis of gene expression (DeepSAGE) tag libraries (Nielsen et al., 2006) using a modification to facilitate direct sequencing of the amplicons by Illumina sequencing. The samples from 91 clones were bar-coded with a different identification key. Samples were diluted to a final concentration of 10 nM and were pooled. Each of the three biological replicates was done in a separate pool. Final pool concentrations were estimated using Quant-iT-PicoGreen prior to template DNA hybridization and sequencing on an Illumina Genome Analyzer II (Illumina, San Diego, CA) according to the manufacturer’s instructions. Due to the restriction enzyme NlaIII used for library construction, each tag carries the nucleotides CATG at the 5’ end.

Tag count data were transformed into a data matrix using in-house Perl scripts and transformed to the relative unit of counts per million. Tags included in the analysis had to be present in at least one biological replicate and had to have a count of at least three. Clonal variation between samples was detected (p-value ≤ 0.05) using the exact test for a negative binomial distribution from the Bioconductor (release 3.5) package EdgeR (Robinson et al., 2010) implemented in the R (v.3.2.5; R Core Team, 2016). Tags that did not have significant clonal variation were removed, leaving 6248 tags. The LS mean was calculated for each tag for each clone. The 21-nt tag sequences were aligned against PGSC S. tuberosum group Phureja DM1-3 transcripts (v.3.4) at Spud DB (Hirsch et al., 2014) using blastn. Hits with E-value ≤ 0.5 were filtered in. Where there were multiple blast hits meeting E-value criteria, only the one with the longest alignment was included. 4198 tags were assigned single-hit annotations in this manner and were used for eQTL analysis (Supplementary Table S1). The remaining 2050 tags without hits meeting the criteria or with multiple hits with the same E-value and length of alignment were not included in the eQTL analysis. The tag count data was deposited at the NCBI GEO database accession number GSE107936.

Nanostring nCounter Analysis of Gene Expression

Multiplex analysis of the expression of StSP5G and StCOL1/2 were examined using a nCounter Digital Analyzer (Nanostring Technologies, Seattle, WA). Details of nCounter multiplex gene expression analysis are described elsewhere (Geiss et al., 2008). The same RNA samples used for DeepSAGE were also used for nCounter analysis. Gene expression of six housekeeping genes 18S rRNA, aprt, cyclophilin (Nicot et al., 2005; Tai et al., 2009), elongation factor 1-α (EF-1-α; Nakane et al., 2003) and cox1-B (Li et al., 2010; Quinones et al., 1995) was also measured and the geometric mean of their expression was used to normalize gene expression values (de Almeida et al., 2015; Luo et al., 2011). The probes used for the nCounter analysis are provided in Supplementary Table S2.

DNA Extraction and Genotyping

Fresh leaf material (100 mg) from plants grown in the greenhouse for one month was pulverized in 2 mL lysing matrix “A” tubes (MP Biomedicals), using a FastPrep FP 120 for 40 s in 750 μL of the following extraction buffer: 1.4 M NaCl, 20 mM EDTA, 2% CTAB (w/v), 0.1 M Tris pH 8.4, and 1% 2-mercaptoethanol (v/v). The DNA suspension was incubated 60 min at 60°C after which it was mixed 1:1 with chloroform/isoamyl alcohol (24:1 v/v), and then centrifuged at 13,148g for 5 min. The supernatant was collected and 5 M NaCl added in a 1:40 v/v ratio before precipitation in 95% ethanol for 30 min at –20°C. The DNA was centrifuged at 13,148g for 10 min and the pellet washed in 70% ethanol followed by centrifugation for 5 min. The DNA was suspended in 150 μL sterile distilled water and treated with 1.5 μL of 10 mg/ml DNase-free RNase.

Polymerase chain reaction and high-resolution DNA melting (HRM) analysis of genetic mapping anchor markers was done according to De Koeyer et al. (2010). Primer sequences and locations of anchor markers are found in Supplementary Table S3. Diversity Arrays Technology P/L of Canberra, Australia, provided services for genotyping the 91 diploid potato progeny clones using methods described by Wenzl et al. (2004). Diversity array technology (DArT) markers were analyzed similarly to Sharma et al. (2013). Briefly, DNA from each clone was double digested with restriction enzyme PstI and TaqI ligated to PstI adaptors then amplified by PCR. The PCR products were Cy3 labeled and hybridized together with a Cy5-labeled reference to a high-resolution potato genotyping array containing 680 DArT probes (Sliwka et al., 2012). Arrays were scanned to detect fluorescence intensity at each probe. The data from the scanned images were extracted and analyzed using the DArTsoft 7.4 software (Diversity Arrays Technology P/L, Canberra, Australia). The SolCap 8303 Infinium Chip was used for single nucleotide polymorphism (SNP) genotyping using a procedure described in Felcher et al. (2012). The probe sequences and SNP information are available at http://solcap.msu.edu/potato_infinium.shtml [verified 13 Nov. 2017]. Genotyping of the Solanum tuberosum CYCLING DOF FACTOR (CDF, with DOF meaning DNA-binding one finger) family member, StCDF1, was done using a HRM marker (Supplementary Table S3). Cleaved amplified polymorphic sequence (CAPS) genotyping for the Ve2 gene was done using the Ve2 marker according to Uribe et al. (2014).

Linkage Mapping, QTL, and eQTL Analysis

Low quality and noninformative SNPs were removed prior to mapping using JoinMap 4.1 for linkage mapping with population type CP (cross-pollination) with <hkhx>, <lmx1l>, and <nxnxp> segregation and markers were grouped by regression mapping using Haldane’s function (Kyazma B.V., Wageningen, the Netherlands). Parents were phased and loci coded according to the type of segregation as per the requirement of JoinMap. The LS mean of the disease resistance score was used for QTL analysis using MapQTL 6 (Kyazma B.V., Wageningen, the Netherlands).
For analysis of DeepSAGE gene expression, the log$_2$ ratio of the LS mean tag count over the LS mean tag count for clone 07506-01 was used for composite interval mapping with MapQTL6 (Kyazma B.V., Wageningen, the Netherlands). The LS mean of log$_2$-transformed nCounter gene expression values were used for analysis. The logarithm of odds (LOD) scores across linkage groups for all QTL and eQTL were averaged over 1-cM intervals for the all the tags and disease resistance and were placed in a single data matrix. Multiexperiment viewer (MeV) was used to analyze the pattern of eQTLs across the linkage groups. Hierarchical clustering of tags was done using the Pearson correlation matrix and average linkage clustering. Heat maps of LOD scores across linkage groups were also generated using MeV.

Tags with eQTL at StCDF1 and Ve2 loci were identified by averaging LOD scores for intervals that were within ±1 cM from the mapped location of the StCDF1 and Ve2. Those tags with average LOD scores over the intervals greater than three were identified. Lists of tags with StCDF1 and Ve2 eQTL were compared using Genowiz 4.0 (Ocimum Biosolutions, Indianapolis, IN). Lists of tag with eQTL for StCDF1 only, Ve2 only, or StCDF1 and Ve2 were made. Enrichment analysis for associated GO terms was performed using the topGO (v.2.28.0; Alexa and Rahnenfuhrer, 2010) in R version 3.2.5 (2016). The Revigo wetool (http://revigo.irb.hr/, verified 15 Nov. 2017) was used to produce graph-based visualization of GO network (Supek et al., 2011).

**Epistasis Analysis**

Epistasis between the StCDF1 and Ve2 loci in the regulation of disease resistance and gene expression was tested using the FRGEpistasis package (https://www.bioconductor.org/packages/release/bioc/html/FRGEpistasis.html, verified 17 Nov. 2017; Zhang et al., 2014) in R version 3.2.5 (2016). FRGEpistasis uses the physical map locations of StCDF1 and Ve2 for analysis of epistasis. ANOVA with general linear model was used to analyze differences in disease resistance and gene expression for StCDF1, StSP5G, and StSP6A between genotypic combinations of StCDF1 and Ve2 and Duncan’s test was used for pairwise comparisons between genotypes using SYSTAT 13 (Systat Software, Inc., San Jose, CA).

**Cloning of StCDF1 Alleles**

Rapid amplification of cDNA ends (RACE) was used to clone full-length cDNA for h and k alleles from hh and kk homozygous clones, respectively. The SMARTer RACE 5’/3’ kit (Clontech, Inc., Mountain View, CA) was used with total RNA from leaves according to manufacturer’s instructions. A second round of PCR was done with nested primers. The gene specific primer for 5’ RACE was 5’GATTACGCAAGCTTCCAGCCTCGTTACCTCTGCAAAGAATGCCA (3’GSP1) and the nested primer was 5’GATTACGCAAGCTTGGCAGGATATTGGACTGCTGAGGAGGAC (3’ NGSP2).

5’ and 3’ RACE PCR products were ligated into the pCR4 TOPO TA cloning vector (Thermo Fisher, Waltham, MA) according to manufacturer’s instructions. Plasmids were transformed into *Escherichia coli* using electroporation. Colonies were grown on kanamycin plates and 12 were picked for Sanger sequencing with M13 forward and M13 reverse primers on the Applied Biosystem’s 3730x1 DNA Analyzer at the McGill Genome Quebec Innovation Centre (Montreal, Canada). Assembly of sequences was done using Lasergene 12 Core Suite (DNASTAR, Madison, WI). Multiple sequence alignment with the StCDF1.1 and StCDF1.2 protein sequence (Kloosterman et al., 2013) was done using Clustal W.

**Results**

**Disease Resistance QTL**

A linkage map was constructed from 1602 markers, including 1023 SNP, 545 DArT, and 34 HRM loci (Supplementary Fig. S1). The distribution of the LS mean of the *Verticillium* disease resistance score for the 91 progeny at 100 DAP is shown in Fig. 1. QTL mapping of disease resistance was performed and LOD scores were averaged over 1 cM intervals and the distribution of QTL over all linkage groups was examined. Chromosomes 5 and 9 had QTL peaks with LOD scores over three (Fig. 2). The QTL with the highest LOD score was on chromosome 5 which accounted for 48.2% of the explained variance. The genetic location of markers near QTL for disease resistance was...
compared to the physical location. The order of the markers was highly similar to the physical map; however, the distance between markers on the end of chromosomes was higher in the genetic map. An explanation for this is the tendency in plant chromosomes for higher rates of recombination in subtelomeric regions and lower rates of recombination in centromeric regions (Mézard, 2006).

The QTL on chromosome 5 included one which covered the StCDF1 gene (Fig. 2 and 6a) that encodes a cycling DOF transcriptional repressor which controls timing of maturity and tuberization in potato (Kloosterman et al., 2013). To verify location of the StCDF1 gene in the QTL interval, a HRM genotyping assay was used (Supplementary Table S3). Genetic mapping using the StCDF1 HRM marker confirmed the location of the gene (Fig. 2). The StCDF1 HRM primer was located between the DNA binding and the GI binding domains. The two alleles of StCDF1 in the 15143 population were named h and k.

The QTL on chromosome 9, which accounted for 17% of the explained variance, included the locus for the Ve2, Verticillium wilt resistance gene (Kawchuk et al., 2001). The genetic map location of the Ve2 gene was confirmed using a CAPS marker (Uribe et al., 2014; Fig. 2). Clone 12120-03 was heterozygous for the Ve2 resistance allele (uv) and 07506-01 did not carry resistance alleles (uu; Tai et al., 2013).

**Sequencing of StCDF1 h and k Alleles**

RACE was used to clone the StCDF1 full-length cDNA for the h and k alleles of population 15143. The cDNA sequence analysis indicates that the HRM marker detected a synonymous nucleotide variant (data not shown). Protein sequence alignment demonstrated that the k allele encoded StCDF1.1 (Fig. 3). The h allele encoded a protein with a modified C terminal end that was missing the FKF1 binding domain and was identical to StCDF1.3 (Kloosterman et al., 2013). The HRM genotyping of StCDF1 for the two diploid parents of the 15143 population, clones 12120-03 and 07506-01, showed that both were heterozygous for StCDF1 alleles (data not shown).
Epistasis between Ve2 and StCDF1

The cross of 12120-03 (hk × uv) and 07506-01 (hk × uu) resulted in progeny clones that carried all three genotypic combinations of h and k allele alleles of the StCDF1 gene (hh, hk, and kk); however, there were only two possible Ve2 genotypic combinations, uv and uu. This resulted in six genotypic combinations of StCDF1 and Ve2 alleles: hh*uv, hh*uv, hk*uv, hk*uv, and kk*uv. The average disease resistance score for StCDF1 and Ve2 genotypes is shown in Fig. 4. Presence of the k allele of StCDF1 was associated with increased disease resistance compared with hh homozygotes (Fig. 4a).

Examination of the Ve2 resistance allele showed that disease resistance was not significantly different between uu and uv genotypes in the ANOVA analysis (Fig. 4b). Disease resistance was reduced in hh × uv versus the hh × uu genotypes; however, the Ve2 resistance allele did not have significant effects on clones carrying k allele (Fig. 4c). The difference in disease resistance in the hh × uv versus the hh × uu genotypes was also small in comparison with the differences between hh, hk, and kk genotypes. The effectiveness of the Ve2 resistance allele in increasing disease resistance was dependent on the genotype of StCDF1, which indicated epistasis. The results also indicate that StCDF1 functions downstream of Ve2. Epistatic interaction between the StCDF1 and Ve2 genes was tested using a functional regression model (Zhang et al., 2014). Highly significant interaction with a p value of $1.83 \times 10^{-5}$ was found between the StCDF1 and Ve2 in the control of *V. dahliae* disease resistance.

eQTL Analysis

Biological functions affected by StCDF1 and Ve2 loci at the molecular and cellular levels can be explored using eQTL analysis. eQTL analysis involved quantification of gene expression across Population 15143 and genetic mapping of the QTL for expression each gene. DeepSAGE (Nielsen et al., 2006) was used for genome-wide gene expression analysis across the 91 progeny clones of Population 15143. The DeepSAGE analysis produced 4198 unique tags that were derived from 2210 genes (some tags were derived from different regions of the same gene). A heat map of LOD scores for the eQTL for each of the tags across linkage groups was generated. The genes and their LOD score heat maps were ordered based on their physical location in the genome (Fig. 5). The majority of the high LOD scores were found along the diagonal of the heat map matrix. These results indicated that for most genes the eQTL controlling expression was mapped near the gene (cis-eQTL). This is characteristic of eQTL analyses (Druka et al., 2010; Holloway and Li, 2010) and indicated compatibility of tag count gene expression data for eQTL mapping. There were also many trans-eQTLs, where eQTLs for a gene were found on another chromosome. There were a high number of trans-eQTLs found on chromosome 5 indicating the presence of a master regulator of gene expression. The genome-wide pattern of eQTL was similar to results published by others using microarray data (Kloosterman et al., 2012) indicating that tag count gene expression data could produce similar results as microarrays. Inclusion of tags that were not unique to a single gene resulted in reduced cis-eQTLs (data not shown). Therefore, only unique tags were used.

Gene Ontology Analysis of Genes with eQTL at Ve2 and StCDF1

Genes involved in functions connected to Ve2 or StCDF1 would have eQTL at these loci. Tags with eQTL LOD scores over three at the Ve2 and StCDF1 loci were identified. eQTL LOD scores over three at the Ve2 locus were observed for 103 tags (Fig. 6b, Supplementary Table S4). Among the 103 tags, 41 of the tags were aligned with the same gene, so that there was a total of 59 unique genes in the analysis. There were 505 tags representing 278 unique genes that had eQTL LOD scores over three at the StCDF1 locus (Fig. 6c, Supplementary Table S5). There were nine genes that had eQTL at both the StCDF1 and Ve2: TAG3032 (peptidase, trypsin-like serine and cysteine proteases), TAG1880 (sulfate adenylyltransferase), TAG5170 (Photosystem I reaction center subunit IV B isoform 2), TAG296 (alcohol dehydrogenase), TAG1634 (S-adenosylmethionine synthase 2), TAG2483 (carbonic anhydrase), TAG5908 (Photosystem II 5 kDa protein, chloroplastic). The GO annotations of genes with eQTL at the Ve2 or StCDF1 loci were examined. The GO annotations with p-values $\leq 0.01$ are listed in Supplementary Table S6. The
Fig. 4. Comparisons of disease resistance and gene expression between StCDF1 and Ve2 genotypes. The StCDF1.1h allele was labeled “h” and the StCDF1.1k allele was labeled “k.” The resistance allele for Ve2 was labeled “v” and the susceptible allele was “u.” Disease resistance scores averaged for genotypes of (a) StCDF1, (b) Ve2 and (c) genotype combination of StCDF1 and Ve2. StCDF1 (TAG2322) gene expression averaged for genotypes of (d) StCDF1, (e) Ve2 and (f) genotype combination of StCDF1 and Ve2. Flowering locus T StSP5G gene expression averaged for genotypes of (g) StCDF1, (h) Ve2 and (i) genotype combination of StCDF1 and Ve2. Flowering locus T StSP6A (TAG4626) gene expression averaged for genotypes of (j) StCDF1, (k) Ve2 and (l) genotype combination of StCDF1 and Ve2. ANOVA was done to find significant genotypic variation and pairwise comparisons were done using Duncan’s test. Genotypes with significant differences in disease resistance scores are indicated by different letters above the bars.
largest number of significant GO annotations was for biological process. Figure 7 shows the interactive graphs from the Revigo analysis. Photosynthesis was the GO term with the lowest p-value for both groups of genes. These results indicate that both StCDF1 and Ve2 loci affect photosynthesis. Carotenoid biosynthesis, response to inorganic substance, and glyceraldehyde-3-phosphate metabolism were other GO terms present in both groups. There were many GO terms unique to genes with eQTL at StCDF1 or Ve2. Of interest were the GO terms defense response to fungus, incompatible interaction, plant-type primary cell wall biogenesis, and mitochondrial electron transport GO terms for genes with eQTL at the Ve2 but not the StCDF1 locus. Also of interest was the GO term, response to oxidative stress, that was present for genes with eQTL at StCDF1 but not Ve2. In general, there were more genes with eQTL at the StCDF1 locus producing more GO terms, but the terms associated with photosynthesis were highly significant.

**eQTL of Genes in Tuberization Pathway**

TAG4626 corresponded to the flowering time ortholog of FT, StSP6A. eQTL for TAG4626 were found on chromosome 5 and included the StCDF1 locus, which correlates with the regulation of StSP6A by StCDF1 (Fig. 6a). The eQTL on chromosome 5 accounted for 58.1% of the explained variance. Tags for StSP5G and StCOL1 and StCOL2 were not found among the 4198 tags; therefore, the nCounter analysis was used to quantify expression of these genes. StCOL1 and StCOL2 sequences were highly similar and the nCounter probe for StCOL1/2 could hybridize to both genes. The nCounter data indicates that StCOL1/2 gene expression was not detectable and eQTL were not found (data not shown). The reason may be that StCOL1 and StCOL2 gene expression peaks at the beginning of the day, and the samples were taken in the afternoon when expression was low. Expression of StSP5G was detected and eQTL analysis was done. The eQTL for StSP5G found on chromosome 5 (44.4% explained variance) overlapped with the eQTL for StSP6A including the StCDF1 locus (Fig. 6a), which concurs with regulation of StSP5G by the StCDF1 regulatory pathway.

The StCDF1 protein is regulated by protein degradation by GI and FKF1 (Kloosterman et al., 2013).
Fig. 6. Heat maps of logarithm of odds (LOD) scores for expression quantitative trait loci (eQTL) at Ve2 and StCDF1 loci. The heat map for LOD scores for disease resistance QTL across linkage groups are shown at the top of the figure. The arrows indicate locations of the StCDF1 and Ve2 genes. (a) eQTL for genes in the StCDF1 pathway TAG542 (Gigantea, PGSC0003DMT400048370), TAG3701 (FKF1, PGSC0003DMT400051416), TAG2322 (StCDF1, PGSC0003DMT400047370), StCOL1/2 (PGSC0003DMT400026068), StSP5G (PGSC0003DMT400041726), TAG4626 (StSP6A, PGSC0003DMT400060057), and TAG1067 (StBEL29, PGSC0003DMT400063762). (b) eQTL at the Ve2 locus, and (c) eQTL at the StCDF1 locus. The genes were clustered using hierarchical clustering for (b) and (c). The dendrogram from hierarchical clustering of eQTL LOD scores is shown on the left for (b) and (c). The LOD scores are indicated by a color scale in the top left.
TAG542 corresponded to GI and TAG3701 to FKF1. TAG542 had a major eQTL on chromosome 12 and TAG3701 on chromosome 3. The eQTL for StCDF1 was also examined. There were StCDF1 eQTL on chromosomes 1 and 2, with 19.2 and 21.8% explained variances, respectively (Fig. 6a). The StBEL genes are also involved in regulation of tuberization. StBEL29 was found among the 4198 unique tags. The major eQTL for StBEL29 was mapped to chromosome 2 in a similar region to the eQTL for StCDF1 (Fig. 6a).
The differences between StCDF1 and Ve2 genotypes in gene expression of StCDF1 and downstream genes StSP6A and StSP5G were compared to better understand the interaction between StCDF1 and Ve2 genes (Fig. 4d–l). There were significant effects of the StCDF1 genotype on the expression of the three genes (Fig. 4d, g, i, j, and l), but the Ve2 genotypes did not have significant differences (4e, h, k). When interactions between StCDF1 and Ve1 were examined, StCDF1 and StSP5G expression in hh backgrounds were affected by the presence of the Ve2 resistance allele (Fig. 4f, i). However, expression of StSP6A was not affected by Ve2 genotype, even in the hh background (Fig. 4k, l). Expression levels of the StCDF1 k allele were found to be higher than the h allele (Fig. 4g, i). However, posttranslational regulation by protein degradation is a significant, so transcript levels do not reflect levels of protein and transcription repressor activity (Kloosterman et al., 2013). The expression of StSP5G and StSP6A were increased and decreased, respectively, in the presence of the k allele (Fig. 4i, l), which were consistent with the repressive action of StSP5G on StSP6A expression.

Discussion

Quantitative trait locus mapping of Verticillium wilt resistance identified a region of chromosome 9 that included the Ve2 resistance gene. This result concurs with QTL previously reported in genetic mapping of Verticillium disease resistance in tomato (Diwan et al., 1999; Kawchuk et al., 2001) and potato (Simko et al., 2003; Simko et al., 2004a, 2004b). In addition, the results show that the major QTL for disease resistance identified in this study was not on chromosome 9, but on a region of chromosome 5 that included the StCDF1 gene, which was shown to control tuberization in potato (Kloosterman et al., 2013). eQTL for tuberization regulators StSP6A and StSP5G, which are transcriptionally regulated by StCDF1, overlap with disease resistance QTL on chromosome 5. These results provide evidence for a role for the tuberization pathway in V. dahliae disease resistance in potato. Development of tubers is tightly coordinated with vine maturity (Davies and Gan, 2012; Ewing and Struik, 1992; Kloosterman et al., 2013; Thomas, 2013; Wohleb et al., 2014) and studies done by others have also found that a portion of V. dahliae resistance could be attributed to variation in vine maturity (Jansky and Miller, 2010; Simko and Haynes, 2016; Simko et al., 2004c). However, linkage of disease resistance to chromosome 5 described here is novel. QTL chromosome 5 may have been missed in previous studies that used candidate gene approaches focused on association of the Ve locus to Verticillium wilt resistance (Simko et al., 2003, 2004a, 2004b).

Our study uncovered epistasis between the StCDF1 and Ve2 genes, where StCDF1 functioned downstream of the Ve2 gene. The interaction between the two genes was not direct as Ve2 encodes a membrane protein (Kawchuk et al., 2001) and StCDF1 functions in the nucleus as a transcriptional repressor (Kloosterman et al., 2013). StCDF1 encoded a transcription repressor of StCOL1/2, which itself is an activator of StSP5G (Abelenda et al., 2016; Kloosterman et al., 2013). Hence, StCDF1 also represses StSP5G indirectly. StSP6A is repressed by StSP5G so downregulation of the latter increases the former, which leads to tuberization. Clones homozygous for the StCDF1.3 allele (h) had the lowest disease resistance scores. This was attributed to the loss of protein degradation for the StCDF1.3 protein (Kloosterman et al., 2013). Accumulation of StCDF1.3 under long days triggered early maturity and tuberization which was scored as low disease resistance. The presence of the Ve2 resistance allele significantly increased disease resistance in the hh background. Clones carrying the StCDF1.1 allele (k) had increased disease resistance, which was attributed to the production of full length protein. The full-length StCDF1.1 undergoes degradation under long days leading to delayed maturity and tuberization, which was scored as high disease resistance. Although disease resistance scores were high for clones carrying the StCDF1.1 k allele, the Ve2 resistance allele did not increase disease resistance. One explanation for differences in Ve2 interaction with StCDF1.1 and StCDF1.3 is that the Ve2 resistance functions through downregulation of StCDF1. The StCDF1.1 (k) allele produce proteins that are already downregulated through protein degradation, therefore, effects of the Ve2 gene would not be detected. The StCDF1.3 (h) homozygotes express a truncated protein that is not degraded, therefore, effects of downregulation can be detected.

Clones carrying the StCDF1 h allele from this study had lower expression of StSP5G compared with clones carrying the k allele. StSP5G expression showed increased expression in the presence of Ve2 resistance alleles in the hh background but not in the presence of the k allele. The pattern of StSP5G expression in StCDF1 and Ve2 genotypes was similar to disease resistance and the QTL for disease resistance on chromosome 5 overlapped with the eQTL for StSP5G. These results suggest that the observed epistasis of StCDF1 with Ve2 in disease resistance involves regulation of StSP5G expression. The eQTL for StSP6A on chromosome 5 was also co-localized with disease resistance and the eQTL for StSP5G. The effects of the StCDF1.3 (h) and StCDF1.1 (k) alleles on StSP5G and StSP6A expression were opposite, which is consistent with the repression of StSP6A expression by StSP5G (Abelenda et al., 2016; Kloosterman et al., 2013; Navarro et al., 2011). However, the increased expression levels of StSP5G in hh*uv versus hh*uu, was not concomitant with decreased expression of StSP6A in hh*uv genotypes compared to hh*uu. These results suggest that StSP5G may regulate other downstream genes in response to the Ve2 resistance allele in regulating the timing of maturity and tuberization. Further investigation of the molecular mechanism of the epistasis between StCDF1 and Ve2 will be required. Nonetheless, the current study has provided evidence for supporting a role for StCDF1 and photoperiod-regulated tuberization pathway in V. dahliae resistance. The results also suggest that the V. dahliae pathogen activates the StCDF1 pathway in inducing early
dying. We propose that StCDF1 integrates multiple signals in controlling timing of tuberization in potato including photoperiod and pathogen stress.

The GO analysis of the genes with eQTL at the Ve2 locus showed an enrichment of the GO terms “defense response to fungus,” “incompatible interaction,” and “plant-type primary cell wall biogenesis,” demonstrating a role for Ve2 in defense against V. dahliae. These results concur with genetic studies on resistance to V. dahliae (Bae et al., 2008; Kawchuk et al., 2001; Uribe et al., 2014). On the other hand, fungal response GO terms were not found for genes with eQTL at the StCDF1 locus indicating that StCDF1 was not involved in defense against V. dahliae, and supported a role for StCDF1 downstream of pathogen attack. The most significant GO terms for both genes with eQTL at the Ve2 and StCDF1 loci were associated with the chloroplast including “photosynthesis.” These results were correlated with the photosynthetic decline and chlorosis observed associated with vine maturity (Wohleb et al., 2014 Ewing) and Verticillium-induced early dying (Bowden et al., 1990). The findings from this study further suggest that the photosynthetic decline with V. dahliae infection may occur through activation of the StCDF1 maturity and tuberization pathway.

Our study also provides insights for developing strategies for selection and breeding of resistance to V. dahliae. The evidence provided here and in studies by others demonstrate that the Ve2 resistance allele marker can be beneficial to selection for Verticillium wilt disease resistance (Bae et al., 2008; Kawchuk et al., 2001; Simko et al., 2003, 2004a, 2004b; Uribe et al., 2014). Additionally, the results suggest that selection for StCDF1.1 can reduce symptoms of wilting, chlorosis, and early dying; however, selection for reduced symptoms alone can lead to selection of late maturation and tolerance for the pathogen. Co-selection for V. dahliae resistance genes, together with StCDF1 alleles, is suggested as a strategy to reduce pathogen colonization, early dying, and development of tolerance.

Supplemental Files Available

Supplementary Fig. S1. Linkage maps for 12 potato chromosomes.

Supplementary Table S1. Tag count expression data for population 15143. The field design was a randomized complete block with three replicates plots for each clone in population 15143. The data is the LS mean over the three replicates. The LS mean for each clone was divided by LS mean for parent clone 07506–01 and the log2 ratio was used for QTL mapping.

Supplementary Table S2. Probes used in nCounter CodeSet for analysis of gene expression of StCOL1/2 and StSPSG and housekeeping genes.

Supplementary Table S3. High resolution melting primer sequences. The position of the primer is forward (F), probe (P) or reverse (R). The Dir column indicates sense (+) or anti-sense strand (-). Chr is the chromosome, Pos is the location of the primer on the chromosome, Sequence is the 5’ to 3’ sequence of the primer. The potato genome sequence version was PGSC S. tuberosum group Phureja DM1–3 Pseudomolecules v.4.03.

Supplementary Table S4. Lists of genes with eQTL at Ve2 locus.

Supplementary Table S5. Lists of genes with eQTL at StCDF1 locus.

Supplementary Table S6. GO annotations for genes with eQTL at StCDF1 and Ve2 loci.

Conflict of Interest Disclosure

The authors declare that there is no conflict of interest.

Acknowledgments

The study was funded through A-base funds from Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada. Technical assistance was provided by Kraig Worrall, Cu Jian Zeng, Kathryn Douglass, and Donna Wilson. Daniel Frank, Boshen Gao, Greg Conn and Woong Rho were undergraduate students who contributed to the study. The authors would also like to thank Hielke (Henry) De Jong who established the diploid clones used in the study. Hui Ying Wang received support from the Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada–Ministry of Education (China) program.

References


