Aalborg Universitet



### Renewable energy and waste heat recovery in district heating systems in China

A systematic review

Yuan, Meng; Mathiesen, Brian Vad; Schneider, Noémi; Xia, Jianjun; Zheng, Wen; Sorknæs, Peter; Lund, Henrik; Zhang, Lipeng

Published in: Energy

DOI (link to publication from Publisher): 10.1016/j.energy.2024.130788

Creative Commons License CC BY 4.0

Publication date: 2024

**Document Version** Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Link to publication from Aalborg University

Citation for published version (APA): Yuan, M., Mathiesen, B. V., Schneider, N., Xia, J., Zheng, W., Sorknæs, P., Lund, H., & Zhang, L. (2024). Renewable energy and waste heat recovery in district heating systems in China: A systematic review. Energy, 294, Article 130788. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2024.130788

#### **General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal -

#### Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us at vbn@aub.aau.dk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

### Energy

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/energy

### Renewable energy and waste heat recovery in district heating systems in China: A systematic review

Meng Yuan<sup>a,\*</sup>, Brian Vad Mathiesen<sup>b</sup>, Noémi Schneider<sup>c</sup>, Jianjun Xia<sup>d</sup>, Wen Zheng<sup>d</sup>, Peter Sorknæs<sup>a</sup>, Henrik Lund<sup>a</sup>, Lipeng Zhang<sup>e</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Department of Sustainability and Planning, Aalborg University, Rendsburggade 14, 9000, Aalborg, Denmark

<sup>b</sup> Department of Sustainability and Planning, Aalborg University, A.C. Meyers Vænge 15, 2450, Copenhagen, Denmark

<sup>c</sup> Centre for Global Cooperation, Danish Energy Agency, Carsten Niebuhrs Gade 43, 1577, Copenhagen V, Denmark

<sup>d</sup> Building Energy Research Center, School of Architecture, Tsinghua University, Beijing, 100084, China

<sup>e</sup> Danish Energy Agency, Sino-Danish Strategic Sector Cooperation for Clean Heating in China Program, Beijing, 100052, China

#### ARTICLE INFO

Handling editor: Soteris Kalogirou

Keywords: District heating Renewable energy Waste heat recovery Excess heat China 4th generation district heating Smart energy systems

#### ABSTRACT

Decarbonising the heating sector is one of the key elements to realizing the ambitious dual carbon goals of China, which is the largest carbon emitter and energy consumer globally. Currently, district heating (DH) systems have penetrated approximately 88% of the urban heating areas in Northern China. Nevertheless, around 90% of the heating demand in China still relies on fossil fuels. A larger scale integration of renewable energy and waste heat sources into the DH systems is critical for decarbonising the entire heating sector in China. However, a deeper level of comprehension is required to harness its full potential. This paper provides a thorough investigation of the status, potential, and national policy schemes of renewable energy and waste heat recovery in the DH systems of China. Combined with a critical review of recent literature on relevant areas published in both international and Chinese domestic sources, the trends, challenges, and future perspectives are discussed from scientific research and practical implementation aspects. This paper highlights the synergy of the integration of renewable energy and waste heat sources in DH, the energy efficiency improvements as well as the use of thermal storage technologies through the implementation of 4th generation district heating and smart energy systems that could offer a more economically viable pathway forward.

#### 1. Introduction

#### 1.1. Background

Heating represents almost 50% of the global final energy consumption in the building sector [1]. Among many other heating techniques, the district heating (DH) system is outstanding as an attractive option for a stable supply of space heating and domestic hot water (DHW) for buildings. This is due to its potential to provide an energy-efficient and cost-effective heating supply, especially in dense urban areas with concentrated heat demands that are within economy-of-scope [2]. Nevertheless, the decarbonising potential for DH systems remains largely unexplored, given the dominant role of fossil fuels which account for about 90% of the total heat supply in the global DH networks and contribute significantly to greenhouse gas emissions and air pollution [3]. This is especially the case of China – the largest market for DH worldwide – which has an extensive network of DH pipelines with over 507 thousand kilometres by 2020 [4]. To achieve the global climate target to limit global warming to 1.5 °C, significant mitigation is needed in  $CO_2$  emissions from the Chinese energy system.

The use of DH for space heating in China can be traced back to the 1950s when a few pilot cities explored the substitution of traditional coal-based individual heating with DH to improve residential welfare. After the 1980s, the DH system in Northern China underwent a rapid and substantial expansion. A more detailed timeline of the development of the DH systems in China can be found in Fig. 1 (details of the figure will be introduced in Section 3). DH accounted for 88.2% of the heating demand in the urban areas of Northern China in 2020; however, around 72% of the total heating area remained supplied by coal-fired combined heat and power (CHP) plants and coal boilers [5]. For comparison, coal made up 56.8% of the national primary energy consumption in China for all sectors in the same year, whereas 15.9% was from non-fossil fuels [6]. In 2020, China committed to reaching its peak CO<sub>2</sub> emissions by

\* Corresponding author. *E-mail address:* imeng.yuan@outlook.com (M. Yuan).

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2024.130788

Received 13 November 2023; Received in revised form 18 January 2024; Accepted 22 February 2024 Available online 29 February 2024

0360-5442/© 2024 The Authors. Published by Elsevier Ltd. This is an open access article under the CC BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).



Review



Abbrevi	ations	MOC	Ministry of Construction, People's Republic of China
		MOF	Ministry of Finance, People's Republic of China
BERC	Building Energy Research Center (BERC) at Tsinghua	MOHUR	D Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development,
	University		People's Republic of China
BMF	Biomass molded fuel	NDRC	National Development and Reform Commission, People's
CHP	Combined heat and power		Republic of China
CNKI	China National Knowledge Infrastructure	NEA	National Energy Administration, People's Republic of
$CO_2$	Carbon dioxide		China
COP	Coefficient of performance	PtX	Power-to-X
DH	District heating	RE	Renewable energy
DHW	Domestic hot water	REWH	Renewable energy and waste heat sources
FYP	Five-Year Plan of China	SES	Smart energy systems
HP	Heat pump	TS	Thermal storage
MEE	Ministry of Ecology and Environment, People's Republic of	WH	Waste heat
	China	4GDH	4th generation district heating

2030 and achieving carbon neutrality before 2060 (aka dual carbon goals or "3060" goals). In light of this, the decarbonisation of China's DH system has become increasingly critical.

Phasing out coal stands as the foremost priority in China. During the past few decades, many national policies and regulations have been put forward to promote the development of DH systems and building efficiency. Nevertheless, compared to other sectors, especially the electricity sector, the decarbonisation of the heating sector and the corresponding green transition received relatively late and less attention. After the announcement of the national dual carbon goals, clearer guidelines for promoting renewable heating were suggested. It should be emphasized that DH is a long-term investment [7]; therefore, long-term goals and policies are needed to ensure a development that does not hinder but supports the dual carbon goals.

#### 1.2. Renewable energy and waste heat as promising sources for DH

into the DH systems. A similar integration could potentially provide substantial benefits also in the Chinese context. The reduction of temperatures in the DH grids has been shown to reduce the costs of the energy system and allow for more efficient integration of RE and WH into the overall energy system. Lower grid temperatures reduce the loss from the grid and, more importantly, increase the coefficient of performance (COP) of heat pumps (HPs) and allow for more WH to be utilised directly in the DH grid [8–10].

Especially, the concepts of 4th Generation District Heating  $(4\text{GDH})^1$ [11] and Smart Energy Systems (SES) [12] have emerged as efficient approaches to integrating RE and WH in the DH systems, which have been widely investigated in the European context. The main idea of 4GDH is to better utilise future non-fossil fuel heat sources to decarbonise the DH systems. An illustration of the progress of the concept of 4GDH from the previous three generations is shown in Fig. 2 [13]. Unlike the first three generations of DH systems – from steam systems to



Fig. 1. Timeline of the development of district heating systems in China with main policy progresses in the heating sector (blue area) and building sector (yellow area). (For interpretation of the references to colour in this figure legend, the reader is referred to the Web version of this article.)

The experiences and practices gained from other leading countries of DH in similar climatic conditions, such as Denmark and Sweden, have already shown promising benefits of integrating renewable energy (RE) sources and recovering waste heat (WH), aka excess heat in literature,

 $<sup>^{1}</sup>$  The concept of fifth-generation district heating and cooling (5GDHC) is excluded from the discussion of this paper.



Fig. 2. Concept of the 4th Generation District Heating compared with the previous three generations [13].

hot-water systems, 4GDH is expected to facilitate the integration of low-temperature RE sources and the recovery of WH from e.g., datacenters and industries in combination with advanced technologies such as HPs and thermal storage (TS) into space heating while considering the efficiency improvement of the buildings as well as the reduced temperature in DH network [10]. The SES displays a coherent approach that integrates the different components of the energy system and exploits synergies through sector integration [12,14,15]. 4GDH can have an important role to play in such SES that combine the electricity, heating, industry, and transportation sectors in a way in which the flexibility across these different areas can compensate for the lack of flexibility from renewable resources such as wind and solar energy.

The scientific aim of this review paper is to establish the status of the technical potential as well as the political strategies and barriers to implementing DH in China. The purpose is to create a platform for the discussion of gaps in current policies for the transition into 4GDH as an integrated part of SES in China.

#### 1.3. Literature gap and contributions

Previous reviews of the Chinese DH systems [16–19] cannot adequately capture the fast changes in the DH systems in China in the recent decade. The latest study of scientific literature review on China's DH was published ten years ago, before 2013 [19], while the review of policy progress was published before 2017 and with a focus on the building sector [18]. The status and practices of the economy and restrictions of clean heating technologies in Northern China, in general, were summarised in Ref. [17] covering both individual and district heating, and an overview of the operational flexibility of DH systems was provided in Ref. [16]. However, some of the investigated clean heating technologies, specifically natural gas and low-emissions coal, are debatable in relation to their ability to contribute to reaching China's climate targets.

Aside from the review studies on the overall DH systems, there are also a wide range of comprehensive technology reviews focused on the respective heat resources and corresponding complementary technologies in China, including solar heating [20], geothermal heating [21], ground source heat pumps [22] and waste water sources HPs [23], WH recovery from the condensers of large turbine units [24] as well as large scale underground seasonal thermal energy storage [25]. However, to the best of the author's knowledge, a systematic review has not yet been made of the implementation of RE and WH in DH systems in a Chinese context from the perspectives of practices, policies, and scientific research. Such knowledge is essential for identifying research gaps and potential policy barriers to facilitating evidence-based decision making in the pursuit of sustainable and efficient DH systems in China.

This paper contributes to the literature by addressing the existing research gap by systematically reviewing and assessing a wide coverage of different subjects, encompassing the current status, policy landscape, and scientific literature on the integration of RE and WH in the DH systems in China. The goal of this paper is to help broaden the understanding of the current challenges and future directions in the field. Given that the specific techniques have already been reviewed and undergone extensive examination in previous studies within the Chinese context [16–25], this paper will refrain from delving into the details of the related technologies. The cutting-edge advancements and experiences in the field from other countries, especially Denmark, are also utilised for discussion to enlighten the peer development of DH in the Chinese context. The focus of this paper is oriented toward future prospects in RE and WH heating as well as the technologies enabling this, such as HPs and TS. Therefore, the discussion in this paper excludes all types of fossil fuels, including natural gas, despite their current prominence in discussions within China.

The remainder of this paper is organised as follows: First, an overview of the status, potential and challenges of different renewable heat and waste heat analysedsources for DH are analysed in Section 2, based on data from international and local statistics in China. Furthermore, the analysis of the current policies and their impacts on the application of RE in DH is presented in Section 3. Section 4 reviews the scientific literature in international journals and Chinese journals. This leads to a discussion and perspectives in Section 5 on the technologies needed, the gaps in current policies as well as research for a transition towards 4GDH and an overall smart energy system in China. Finally, Section 6 concludes the paper.

# 2. Overview of the renewable energy and waste heat in district heating systems in China

The potential of decarbonising DH in China comes from WH recovery, biomass heating, geothermal energy, and solar thermal resources, which are available in different regions across the country. However, challenges of limited land as well as the geographic and temporal mismatch between these heat sources and the demanding area exist. This section first offers an overview of the current status, potential, and challenges of DH in China with a focus on RE and WH, which are analysed from both the demand and supply sides.

It is noted that due to the scarcity of data, detailed official statistics on DH systems in China are only partially available from the national government; however, data from other reliable non-official organisations in the field, mainly the Building Energy Research Center (BERC) at Tsinghua University and the China District Heating Association (CDHA), are adopted in this section as a supplementary.

#### 2.1. Status of the current district heating system

The total fuel consumption for heating systems in China accounts for 20% of the nation's overall energy consumption [26]. As mentioned earlier, DH has a long history in Northern China for providing space heating in winter, aiming to maintain indoor temperatures at no less than 18 °C during the heating season, while domestic hot water mainly relies on individual solutions. China covers several different climate zones, which leads to variations in the duration of heating seasons across different regions, e.g., four months for North China and five to seven months for Northeast and Northwest China.

China is divided into five main heating zones according to the local climate conditions [27], namely severe cold, cold, hot summer cold winter, hot summer warm winter, and temperate, as shown in Fig. 3. The boundary of the DH area in China has been determined by a North-South heating line known as the "Qinling Mountains – Huaihe River" line. This line corresponds to the 0 °C isotherm of January in China [28]. DH is predominantly available in the severe cold and cold areas located in the northern part of the line, which is marked by white dashed lines in Fig. 3. These areas were nominated by the State as the location for the DH system installation in the 1950s with the aim to improve residential welfare.

The promotion of DH and the rapid development of urbanization in China has led to significant growth in DH coverage and gradually reached saturation in recent years, as shown in Fig. 4 [4,29]. In 2020,

the total building heating area in northern China was 15.6 billion  $m^2$ , while the area covered by DH was about 9.88 billion  $m^2$  [30]. The average heat loss rate in the DH pipeline network was around 20% in the same year [30]. The annual growth rate of the DH area has decreased from 16.3% in 2010 to 6.8% in 2021, with an average annual growth rate of 10%. By 2021, DH covered 18 provincial administrative regions, which are primarily in the Northern part of the country whereas DH is rarely provided in South and Southwest China, as shown in Fig. 4 (a).

The structure of the entire heating system in China, as depicted in Fig. 4 (b), shows that the DH system is predominantly reliant on coal as the primary heating fuel. Around 72% is provided by coal boilers and CHP. The data here include the heat supplies in all applications, including both individual heating and DH. The heat demand covered by RE resources (geothermal and biomass), industrial WH and electricity took up 8%. Although the precise data on the share of these technologies in the supply of DH are incomplete, it can be estimated that the share of WH and RE in DH is even lower than in the heating sector in general. The total district heating area in China during 2010–2021 is shown in Fig. 4 (c), where the cities predominant the DH areas.

#### 2.2. Overview of the national heat demands

Identifying the heat demands is a critical step for the further investigation of the carbonization of the supply side. Considering the trend of future population, urbanization rate, and the building floor area, the current and future heat demands in 2035 and 2050 in the northern and southern urban areas of China, respectively, are estimated as shown in Fig. 5. The demand data is based on a study by BERC and more details can be found in Ref. [32].

Two scenarios, Reference Scenario and Fast-renovation Scenario, are employed here. The first scenario assumes that the existing non-energyefficient buildings and corresponding DH networks will be renovated at the current speed, i.e., there will remain 23% and 15% low energyefficient buildings in 2035 and 2050, respectively. In the second scenario, all the existing low energy-efficient buildings and DH networks will be renovated before 2035.

The total heat demand in China is expected to be approx. 4350-4950 PJ in 2035, while the demand will drop to around 4500-4800 PJ in 2050 due to energy efficiency improvements and a declining population. The northern part of China will make up more than 80% of the total heat demand. The total heat demand estimation of northern China is based on detailed analyses at the city and county level consisting of 1047 urban regions<sup>3</sup> using the ArcMap 10.3 software, which delivers the geographical distribution of heat demand in 2050 as shown in Fig. 6. Most cities in North China have a dense population and an intense heating demand with an average demand higher than 500 MW, while the urban regions in Northwest China are dispersed with an average heat demand of around 100 MW and only the capital of the provinces showing a relatively higher demand. It shall be noted that the predictive data for the heat demand in southern China remains a large uncertainty due to the fact that the heating roadmap in the region is still under discussion. Thus, this paper provides the total value of the southern heat demand instead of presenting a more detailed geographical distribution.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> According to the Chinese classification, there are five levels of administration: provincial, prefecture, county, township, and village. In 2017, there were 1340 county-level units in the 15 Northern provinces, which constitute the spatial entities in this study. After merging some of the municipal districts due to these circumstances, this study utilises 1047 urban units (UUs) representing the cities and county seats in Northern China, including 622 counties and 425 cities.



Fig. 3. Climate zones in mainland China. Note: reproduced based on Ref. [31].



Fig. 4. Status of the district heating systems in mainland China. (a) Urban district heating areas in different provinces in China in 2021; (b) The structure of the heating systems in China by heat production technologies in 2021; (c) The total district heating area in China during 2010–2021.<sup>21</sup>

# 2.3. Status, potential and challenges of renewable energy and waste heat recovery in district heating systems

The heating sector can be decarbonised by combining the implementation of WH and RE in DH, renovation of buildings and energy efficiency improvement. This section provides an update on the status of the WH and RE technologies currently being developed in Chinese DH systems as well as the corresponding potential and challenges.

#### 2.3.1. Waste heat recovery

WH refers to the heat generated as a by-product in the industrial or tertiary sector that can be recovered for multiple applications [33].



Fig. 5. The current and future heat demands in urban areas of China under different scenarios.



Fig. 6. The heat demand of 1047 urban regions in Northern China in 2050.

Depending on the temperature level of the WH source and the DH grid temperature, WH can be either directly useable in the DH system, if the temperature of the WH source is sufficiently high, or indirectly via HPs, if the inherent temperature level of the WH source is too low to allow for direct utilisation [8]. For example, HPs can be combined with the lower-temperature heat sources recovered from the changing decarbonised industrial sector [34]. The utilisation of WH can be an important resource in DH systems to decrease fuel consumption, e.g., coal consumption, for heat supply.

The technical potential of WH in China is presented in Fig. 7 according to the BERC [26]. The total WH that can be recovered during the winter season is around 7700 PJ, which is more than one-third of the total annual potential, i.e., approx. 19,800 PJ. The heat recovery from the existing condensing thermal power plants and the nuclear power plants consists of approx. 60% of the WH sources available in China. The third largest WH source is the energy-intensive industries that consume

 $<sup>^2</sup>$  In the statistics division of China, the urban area refers to the areas under the jurisdiction of cities and the areas of towns under the jurisdiction of counties, and the rural area refers to the areas of townships under the jurisdiction of counties.



Fig. 7. Recovery potential of waste heat sources in China.

abundant amounts of fossil fuels in their production process such as steel making, cement production and chemical industries. The total energy consumption of the industry sector accounted for 66.3% of the total energy consumption in China in 2021 [6]. And the rest of the WH potential comes from power transformation substations and datacentres.

The utilisation of WH in DH systems helps to improve overall energy efficiency. However, challenges remain in terms of the mismatch in time, location and temperatures between the supply and demand side. The heat output of the WH sources and the heat demand are inconsistent most of the time, which requires short-term and potentially seasonal thermal storage to balance the system. Also, the WH sources in China are usually located in the outskirts of the heat demand areas, as the energyintensive industries have been strategically relocated to the suburbs along with the rapid urbanization in recent years. Therefore, longdistance, energy-efficient, and low-cost DH grids are critical to using the WH to a larger extent. Aside from the technological challenges, from the policy perspective, there is no specific regulatory authority in China to coordinate and optimise the utilisation of WH at the local level, which hinders the large-scale applications of WH. Also, there is uncertainty related to the use of WH, as the source of the WH might shut down or experience reduced activity resulting in a decrease in the WH available [35].

#### 2.3.2. Biomass heating

Biomass heating is a mature technology in China compared with other renewable heating options. The main part of biomass heating is based on CHP and boilers, using agricultural and forestry biomass and biomass molded fuel (BMF). But waste incineration and biogas heating through the conversion process of biomass also play a role.

By 2019, the total heating area supplied via biomass technologies in China was about 480 million m<sup>2</sup>, of which 70% was covered by biomassfired CHP plants, 18.8% was by BMF boilers, and the rest was provided by biogas heating and biomass stoves [36]. The major DH-demanding areas in the Northeast, North and Central China mainly produce agricultural residues, while forestry residues are distributed in the Southwest and South China. More specifically, the CHP projects are mainly distributed in Shandong, Hebei, Liaoning, Heilongjiang, Jilin and Henan, while the BMF market is mostly in the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region, Shandong, the Pearl River Delta, and the central and eastern regions [37].

Following the same principles in Section 2.2, the BERC at Tsinghua University also investigated the heating potential of biomass resources and waste incineration in northern China. Biomass heating is expected to have a significant increase in the future, from the current level of 922 PJ in 2018 to a potential of 3058 PJ in 2050, while the potential of waste incineration is around 601 PJ in 2018 and may decrease to 565 PJ in 2050 due to waste recycling.

Despite the abundant potential, it should be considered that there is a limit to how much biomass can be used in the energy system if it is to be used at sustainable levels. Locally available sustainable biomass resources vary from area to area, but according to the estimation from the European Union, around 10-30 GJ biomass per capita can be considered a sustainable utilisation in the energy system [38]. The recent investigation on the maximum bioenergy potential in China varies from 41.21-58 EJ in the literature [39,40], which corresponds to 29~41GJ/capital. The major challenge for biomass heating is the competition between the energy sectors. The overall sustainability limit on biomass consumption for energy means that it is important to prioritize where in the energy system the need for using biomass is most relevant. Studies normally find these sectors to be industries and long-haul transport as they are hard to directly electrify [34,41-43], which also means that the biomass resources for the heating sector are limited.

#### 2.3.3. Geothermal heating

China possesses abundant geothermal resources with recoverable

reserves exceeding 20 EJ and has been the largest country in the world in terms of the scale of direct geothermal utilisation for many years. Geothermal heating has become the main force of growth in the heating market among all RE sources in recent years. By 2021, the geothermal heating and cooling area in China reached 1.33 billion  $m^2$  [44]. The utilisation of shallow geothermal energy has witnessed a remarkable increase, while the development of medium-deep hydrothermal resources continues to expand mainly in Shandong, Hebei, and Henan. The exploration of hot-dry-rock geothermal has also started. In 2020, the installed capacity for hydrothermal heating, both with and without heat pumps (primarily for shallow geothermal systems), reached 14.2 GW and 26.5 GW, respectively. This resulted in an annual heat production of 197 PJ and 246 PJ, respectively [45].

The distribution of geothermal resources is uneven across the country with a clear pattern of irregularity and regional variation [46]. The distribution map of geothermal resources in China can be found in Ref. [47]. The geothermal resources are particularly well-suited for DH applications in China, as they offer a consistent source providing a reliable baseload supply. In addition, the distribution of geothermal resources in China is highly overlapped with northern areas in need of clean heating solutions, particularly in areas lacking coverage from the natural gas pipeline network [48]. The medium-deep hydrothermal geothermal resources are promoted as the main clean heating options in these regions, including Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei, Shanxi, Shandong, Shaanxi, Henan, Qinghai, Heilongjiang, Jilin and Liaoning. To minimize the impacts on the soil underground, rock and groundwater, the applications of rejection with the same level as the production zone and heat exchange via a closed system are encouraged [49]. In particular, medium-depth geothermal heat pump systems have been proven to be a potentially efficient and applicable solution for cold regions with a lower need for space occupation, which is a key factor to be considered in the Chinese context [50,51].

Geothermal heating faces the challenge of being relatively costly to develop. Geothermal heating is very dependent on the local underground condition, which brings a high upfront cost in relation to prestudies to investigate the underground potential for geothermal heat. Even after a proper pre-study, the deep geothermal projects also have a high degree of uncertainty which brings a high upfront CAPEX cost. Also, depending on the temperature levels of the underground and the DH grid, HPs might be needed to boost the temperature of the geothermal heat for proper utilisation in the DH system, which in turn increases the costs.

#### 2.3.4. Solar heating

Solar energy has been a prominent source for DHW in China for decades. However, solar thermal energy has very few applications in space heating and industrial heating. Approximately 96% of applications cater to DHW, with only 4% serving space heating and industrial process heating needs [52]. In 2020, the solar heating area reached 16.5 million m2 in China [53]. China has an installed solar capacity of 20–110 MW<sub>th</sub> for DH systems with an average heat capacity factor of about 0.7 kW<sub>th</sub>/m<sup>2</sup> for its solar heating collectors. The largest solar DH system is implemented in Shijiazhuang in the Hebei province, while most of the smaller solar DH systems are situated in Tibet [54].

Solar radiation resources in China are generally abundant, although they show significant variation across regions due to distinct geographical conditions, as seen in Fig. 8 [55]. The lowest solar radiation areas are located in the Sichuan-Chongqing region with around 950 kWh/m<sup>2</sup>, whereas the highest annual global radiation is 2330 kWh/m<sup>2</sup> in Tibet [56]. Solar energy has considerable potential in the severe cold and cold regions of China [57–59].

However, considerations such as space requirements and impact on landscapes can hinder the penetration of solar DH systems, particularly in densely populated urban areas where land costs are expensive, and there is a scarcity of suitable locations for the installation of solar collectors. Also, the seasonal variation of solar energy can limit the



Fig. 8. Global horizontal irradiation in China. Note: Data for islands in South China Sea are not included here.

potential. Despite the option of increasing the potential by use of seasonal storage, the corresponding thermal loss still exists, which in turn increases the cost and potentially takes up space depending on the type utilised. Based on previous studies in Europe [60], the solar thermal share in the DH areas can be 6-12% of the total DH production with a 50% solar penetration rate, referring to the share of buildings that are connected to a solar thermal system.

#### 2.3.5. Large-scale heat pumps

HPs are energy efficient heat generation technologies, which can extract heat from multiple sources, such as surrounding air, soil underground or nearby water sources, and upgrade to a desired temperature. Though HPs are also considered as enabling technologies for utilising WH and geothermal resources, the discussion of large-scale HPs here excludes these two resources, since they are discussed in previous sections.

When leveraging RE-based green electricity, the integration of largescale HPs in the DH systems is expected to play a significant role in the decarbonisation of the heating sector [61]. Currently, quite a large proportion of large-scale HPs in China is powered by non-RE electricity. The capacity of the renewable power generator accounted for 42.5% of the total power capacity in China by 2020 [49]. In the severe cold region such as Northeast China, air-source HPs have relatively low efficiency due to the low ambient air temperature; thus, HPs based on geothermal and WH are more desirable. In Central and North China, large-scale HPs based on multiple sources are suitable depending on the local conditions [62].

Though large-scale HPs could contribute to the transformation of the heating sector with the decarbonisation of the electricity sector, the implementation of large-scale HPs poses significant challenges in many cities in the Chinese context. The high population and building density in urban areas present obstacles to the higher penetration of ground-source HPs, as the limited underground space is shared by all human activities and cannot be exclusively allocated to the DH network. The natural low-temperature heat sources are also insufficient to meet the heating demands of high-heat-density urban areas. These sources can typically provide heat to 20–30% of the buildings in urban areas in China [26]. Studies in Europe also indicate that there is a large potential for large-scale HPs in future DH systems covering up to 25–30% of the district heating production [63].

# 2.4. Summary and assessment of the balance between resource potential and heat demand

To sum up, the main potential for decarbonising DH in China comes from the heat recovery from thermal power plants. In addition to that, WH in other forms, biomass, geothermal energy, and solar thermal resources are also available in different regions across the country. However, challenges exist in terms of limited land in urban areas as well as the geographic and temporal mismatch between these heat sources and the demanding area.

However, industrial WH needs large-scale HPs or biomass during peak demand as these cannot be covered by geothermal or solar resources. Solar energy DH could play a role in southern China where the heat demand pattern is not known. Where there is potential for industrial WH (Northeast China), solar thermal energy is not compatible as summer demand would be covered and the heating season corresponds to the period when solar thermal resources are less abundant.

#### 3. National policy and regulation mechanisms

In this section, a thorough analysis of the current national policies concerning RE and WH recovery in DH systems in China is presented, beginning with an overview of the national regulatory framework and followed by a comprehensive analysis of the different stages of policy development.

#### 3.1. National regulatory framework of district heating

China's approach to regulating and developing its energy systems, including DH systems, is characterized by a top-down regulatory system. At the national level, the national ministries (e.g., NEA, NDRC, MOHURD, MEE, MOC, MOF, etc.<sup>4</sup>) are responsible for the overall development guidelines according to corresponding functions. The aim is to solve the common problems across the country. A series of development initiatives targeting different energy subsectors are issued by the respective national ministries every five years, called Five-Year Plans (FYP). The latest plans are the 14<sup>th</sup> FYP for the year 2021–2025. At the local level, the province government (autonomous regions and municipalities) compiles and implements the local clean heating plan in accordance with the requirements of the national plan and according to the local conditions of the region. At the corporate level, energy-related companies at all levels, encompassing electricity, oil and gas, and heating sectors, are required to break down and put into effect the goals set by the government.

# 3.2. National policies on district heating, renewable energy and waste heat recovery

As the primary heat supplier in northern China, DH has received increasing attention from the central government. Over the last two decades, a series of national policies, regulations, standards, and support measures relating to the heating sectors were developed as indicated earlier in Fig. 1. More details of the major national-level policies that cover DH-related components and corresponding key points are summarised in Table A1 in the Appendix. According to the level of support for RE and WH, the policy development of DH systems in China can be divided into three stages as follows.

#### Stage 1: Progressive development of the heating sector (pre-2017)

Prior to 2017, the regulations on the overall heating sector were typically covered in the national FYP for energy development. However, these regulations lacked a clear and comprehensive nationwide strategy for the heating sector. Starting from the 11<sup>th</sup> FYP and continuing through the 14<sup>th</sup> FYP, there was a shift in policy orientation from promoting CHP to the utilisation of cleaner heat sources including RE and WH. Additionally, specific policies related to the utilisation of geothermal and WH in the overall heating sector were introduced in 2012 and 2015, respectively, though they did not explicitly target DH. With regard to the building sector, three steps of building efficiency improvements were implemented from 1986 to 2010 which helped to reduce the unit energy consumption of the end-users.

### Stage 2: Moderate development of RE and WH for heating (2017-2021)

Despite recent efforts to reduce coal consumption and promote sustainable growth, the heating sector in China attaches great importance to natural gas as an economic alternative to coal due to the fast replacement, rather than fully embracing RE and WH solutions. To address environmental issues brought by coal-based heating, the first national plan focusing only on the heating sector, "Clean Winter Heating Plan in Northern China (2017-2021)", was issued in 2017 [64]. The plan aims to realise 70% coverage of "clean heating" in northern China and reduce dispersed coal consumption by 2021 [65]. However, it should be noted that the concept of "clean heating" still includes natural gas and ultra-low-emission<sup>5</sup> coal. Natural gas was given high importance, whereas RE (geothermal, biomass, and solar energy) and electricity were regarded as supplementary mainly in the rural areas, where local conditions were suitable and there was a lack of gas infrastructure. Since the plan did not differentiate the DH target from the overall target of the heating sector, it remains uncertain how much RE and WH were integrated into the DH system.

In addition to the plan [64], other support policies for heating were issued in 2017 from the aspects of pricing and finance. For instance, the electricity and gas pricing policy for heating was improved to ensure the same electricity price for HP heating as for household electric heating, establishing a sound pricing mechanism of heating according to local conditions [66], and financial support was provided to pilot cities [67]. Furthermore, tax incentives were introduced for heating enterprises and residents. In addition, the 4th step of building efficiency improvement was also implemented in 2019, aiming at achieving 75% energy savings in the new buildings compared with the 1980s level.

Stage 3:RE and WH era towards dual carbon goals (post-2021)

Since China's pledge in 2020 to achieve its national dual carbon goals, the imperative of integrating a higher share of renewable energy into the entire national energy system has grown significantly. In response, a series of national support policies have been put forward. In early 2021, the first national strategy on RE heating was proposed – "Notification of Implementing Renewable Energy Heating Suitable to Local Conditions" [68]. It emphasized the promotion of renewable heating technologies, i.e., geothermal, biomass and solar thermal, in the heating sector as well as the corresponding policy support, and also defined the corresponding restrictive requirements considering environmental issues.

In the same year, another national guideline on geothermal energy was released – "Several Opinions on Promoting the Development and Utilisation of Geothermal Energy" [69], which set mid-to-long term targets for geothermal heating, i.e., achieving a 50% increase in the geothermal heating and cooling area in 2025 compared to 2020, and then double the area in 2035 compared to 2025. Additionally, the Opinions [69] referred to meeting the growing heating demand in southern China for the first time. More specifically, it promoted the utilisation of geothermal energy

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Abbreviations of the related national ministries are listed as follows. NEA: National Energy Administration; NDRC: National Development and Reform Commission; MOHURD: Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development; MEE: Ministry of Ecology and Environment; MOC: Ministry of Construction; MOF: Ministry of Finance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Ultra-low-emission refers to the emission concentrations of smoke, sulphur dioxide, and nitrogen oxides, which shall not be higher than 10, 35, and 50 mg/m<sup>3</sup> respectively under the condition of 6% oxygen content as a reference level.

in the alpine regions of Yunnan and Guizhou and water-source HPs in the middle and lower reaches of the Yangtze River.

Subsequently, the latest national plans of the 14<sup>th</sup> FYP were issued in 2022, encompassing a broader range of aspects related to DH. For instance, "*The 14<sup>th</sup> FYP for the Modern Energy System*" [49], which outlined the comprehensive energy development strategy, addressed various aspects of DH. This included the promotion of CHP transformation and electric heating, the utilisation of WH from industrial and nuclear power plants, the incorporation of geothermal heating where conditions allowed, smart network operation coordination with both power and gas grids, and the implementation of clean heating electricity and heat pricing.

Detailed support for RE in the heating sector was elaborated more in "*The 14*<sup>th</sup> *FYP for Renewable Energy Development*" [49], which further covered biomass heating and heating infrastructure. For instance, it emphasized the upgrading of biomass power generation to cogeneration and encouraged the use of large and medium-sized biomass boilers for DH in urban areas. Moreover, "*The 14*<sup>th</sup> *FYP for the Development of New Energy Storage*" [70] introduced, for the first time, the pivotal enabling technology of thermal storage for a range of temporal resolutions, from daily to seasonal. Furthermore, "*The 14*<sup>th</sup> *FYP for National Urban Infrastructure Construction*" [30], addressed the enhancement of the urban DH network, including reducing heat loss in existing networks, minimizing building energy consumption, and expediting the renovation of ageing pipes and substations.

#### 4. Scientific literature review on district heating in China

This section reviews the scientific literature to provide a comprehensive understanding of the research on the DH system in China from both internatioal sources and Chinese domestic sources.

#### 4.1. Approach of literature review

Five steps are adopted to carry out the literature search and review, as shown in Fig. 9. The focus is put on the studies published in scientific journals from both international and Chinese local publishers to track the cutting-edge topics on the DH systems in China. Two major databases are employed, i.e., Scopus for international journal articles and China National Knowledge Infrastructure (CNKI) for the Chinese domestic journal articles. For the latter, note that only the articles published in the Core Chinese academic journals are included for a more professional screening.

Table 1 lists the detailed scope information used for the initial literature search process in Step 1. To make sure the articles are closely within the subject of this paper, i.e., DH system in China, an article screening process is necessary as presented in Step 3. In Step 4, an expanded search is conducted by adding RE into the search key words so as to find the remaining articles that are not found in the first round.

There is a variety of subtopics in the DH-related literature, including both review articles and research articles. To better understand the purposes, forms, and focus areas of these studies, the research articles are divided into four main categories: component-focused, district heating system-focused, energy system-focused, and policy focused. Table 2 shows the detailed descriptions of each category. The difference between component-focused and district heating system-focused is whether the article investigates more than one component. For instance,

#### Table 1

Scope of the literature searches.

#### Table 2

Description of the classification of journal articles.

Article categorie	25	Descriptions
Review or surv	ey articles	Review and analyse research previously published or provide survey results of the status of the DH system in China.
Research articles	Component-focused	Studies only focus on the heating sector and investigate a single component of the DH system, e.g., building, DH pipe network, heat generation utilities (CHP, boilers, HPs, etc.), thermal storage, heat sources (fossil fuel, WH, biomass, geothermal, solar thermal, wind).
	District heating system-focused	DH system-level study that only focuses on the heating sector and includes multiple system components.
	Energy system- focused	Studies consider the multiple sector synergy in the energy system instead of the single heating sector.
	Policy-focused	Studies focus on the discussion of heating policy, regulation, or institution related issues.

research that investigates the technical issue of thermal storage will fall into the category of component-focused, while research that optimises the solar DH system with thermal storage will be included in the category of system-focused.

#### 4.2. Review of the scientific literature in international journals

A total of 268 scientific articles related to the DH system in China were published in international journals during 2010–2022. Most of the authors are from Chinese universities and research institutes. A lack of review study is found that summarises all kinds of RE applications in the DH system of China.

Fig. 10 (a) shows the number of journal articles published each year, illustrating an increasing interest in the DH system in China during the past decades. The slight decline in papers published in 2021 and 2022 might be attributed to the effects of COVID-19. Component- and DH system-focused articles constitute the largest share in each year. The number of energy system- and policy-focused articles has grown since 2017, when the 'Clean Winter Heating Plan in Northern China (2017-2021)' was issued by the central government, which drew significant academic attention. Fig. 10 (b) shows the number of research articles classified by the main topics identified. Various topics are found for the DH system regarding technical, environmental, social, and policy aspects. Note that articles with hybrid topics may count multiple times in the respective classification. It is found that the top five topics are the operation optimisation, design, or reliability analysis of the DH network [71-73], HPs [74-76], CHP plants [77-79], WH utilisation [80-82] and policy aspects [83-85] (see Fig. 10).

From the perspective of heat sources, coal was the most widely used fuel in conventional CHP plants in the last decades, which caused heavy air pollution in Northern China [86]. To improve the air quality and accomplish the climate target, China has been looking for alternatives to coal in recent years and has issued a series of policies. Due to this, studies on the heating transition of "coal to gas" [85,87,88] and "coal-to-electricity" [89,90] emerged after 2017. However, inadequate domestic gas reserves and insufficient infrastructure resulted in gas

scope of the incratu	it startits.				
Data sources	Language	Keywords	Range	Article type	Period
Scopus	English	"China" and "District heating, Central heating or Clean heating"	Title, abstract, or author-specified keywords	Scentific journal article	2010-2022
CNKI- Core Journals	Chinese	"区域供热" or "集中供热"			



Fig. 9. Flowchart of the literature search process.

shortage during the winter heating season as well as other problems. In relation to a further decarbonisation of the heating sector, academic interests are reflected in the increasing focus on other alternatives of heat sources. The interests according to which the number of articles are sorted are WH utilisation, wind integration, biomass, solar thermal, and geothermal. WH is regarded as one of the most promising ways [91, 92]. Most literature investigated the implementation of recovering WH from CHP [93,94], thermal power plants [95] and nuclear power plants [96] with absorption HPs, from industries [80,82] such as iron and steel production [97,98], and very few analysed the possibility of the datacentres [99,100].

To reduce the problem of wind power curtailment in northern China, some research [101] introduced power-to-heat devices, including HP and electric boilers in the existing DH system, which is commonly in combination with TS [102,103]. Biomass heating is considered as a cleaner alternative instead of the coal used for heating in rural areas [104]. Studies investigated the positive effects of biomass boilers [105] and high-efficiency biomass stoves [106] to replace the traditional low-efficiency household heating stoves. For solar thermal, despite the limited application for space heating in China due to a significant obstacle of land availability, the literature still shows interests in solar DH systems, which are commonly installed with the assistance of seasonal TES [107-110] and air-or ground-source HP [107,111] to guarantee system reliability and cost feasibility. Geothermal heat is considered an underutilised resource for DH in China due to inadequate awareness, high upfront cost, and technical barriers. Existing research on the utilisation of geothermal heat in the DH system mainly focused on investment strategy [112,113], technical evaluation [114], and related environmental and economic analyses [115].

In addition, increasing academic interests are found in the debate of whether Southern China should apply DH [28,116]. Compared to the north area which is dominated by a DH system, in the south area, the efficiency and thermal comfort are much lower, but the price is higher [117]. Evidence found that promoting the DH market in appropriate areas in South China where the conditions are suitable may improve residential welfare and indirectly reduce energy consumption and financial burdens [28], which will bring new opportunities for RE heating in the southern area.

Looking into the energy system-based articles, research has been carried out on the issue of reducing wind curtailment in the North [118–120], and planning the future heat roadmap in China [121]. Interests in the design and operation of integrated energy systems [122–126] have been growing in the past five years, including the DH system as the key element. However, most research only studied the synergy between the electricity and heating sector.

The major gaps lie in the fact that very few studies investigate 4GDH or low-temperature DH in China. Tong et al. [127] estimated the energy-saving potential for a heating/cooling system in 20 cities in two Chinese provinces, which highlighted the importance of utilising low-grade WH from industries through 4GDH. Yuan et al. [61] found that large-scale HPs can be one of the feasible options to decarbonise DH in the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region. Fu et al. [128] designed a DH system using low-grade thermal energy for large cities, large WH sources, and high heating densities.

#### 4.3. Review of the scientific literature in Chinese journals

To broaden the understanding of the DH research interests in local journals, a review of the academic articles published in Chinese journals was conducted, which identified a total of 285 scientific articles published about DH. Different from international publications, a considerable number of the authors publishing in domestic journals are from the private sector.

Fig. 11 (a) shows the number of journal articles published each year during 2010–2022, which illustrates a similar trend as in international literature. Component- and DH system-focused articles were the two dominant aspects before 2017, while the number of energy systemfocused articles began to increase afterwards. Fig. 11 (b) shows the number of research articles classified by the main topics identified. It is found that the most frequently focused topic is the DH network, including both theoretical analysis, field research and case studies. This is followed by the three main topics of CHP, building consumption and HPs. By contrast, there are relatively fewer studies published in local journals on the topics of WH, solar thermal, biomass heating, and other RE heating. One of the major reasons behind this is that most researchers from academia prefer to publish cutting-edge studies in international journals, rather than domestic journals, to have a greater scientific impact.

Compared with the findings of international publications, there are similar insights from domestic articles in terms of WH utilisation, wind, biomass, solar, and geothermal. As for WH, most literature investigated the implementation of recovering WH from power plants [129-132] and industries [133-135], while very few analysed the utilisation of WH from recycled water [136]. To reduce the amount of wind curtailment in northern China, some research discussed the integration of the heating system and the power supply system [137], and the introduction of electric heating equipment in the DH system, especially the heating systems designed with thermal storage devices [138]. As for biomass heating, since the direct combustion of biomass has led to severe air pollution, both biomass gas [139] and biomass briquettes [140] have been introduced to utilise rural surplus biomass in urban DH systems. In relation to the utilisation of solar thermal, the literature on solar DH systems recently started to focus on seasonal TES [141]. Besides, there are some examples of existing research [142,143] focusing on the performances of the DH system combining with geothermal energy devices. However, in northern China, geothermal energy is mostly used for decentralised heating, and only accounts for a small proportion of DH.

Looking into the energy system-based articles, most research only investigated the synergy between the electricity and heating sector, e.g., reducing the wind curtailment in the North [144,145], promoting electric heating with thermal storage [146,147], as well as the comprehensive management of DH heating systems and power supply systems [148]. However, the other sectors of the energy system have not been considered.



(a)



Fig. 10. Number of articles about district heating in China published in international journals during 2010–2022. (a) Number of articles by year; (b) Number of articles by main topics.

#### 5. Discussion and perspectives

#### 5.1. Policy implications for integrating WH and RE in DH systems

Despite some guiding instructions that have been issued to promote the integration of low-temperature RE and WH in the DH systems, they are still in their infancy. Heating transition is a long-term, arduous task with high market demand. Existing policies are faced with a variety of challenges, which are summarised from the following aspects.

# (1) The definition of "clean heating" sources is subject to debate.

The current pricing and support policy encompasses all sources of socalled "clean heating", including natural gas and low-emission coal. RE heating lacks a competitive advantage when compared to fossil fuels due to higher investment and operating costs. Ensuring profitability for heat supply enterprises while providing affordable heat to energy users pose a challenge. It is necessary to introduce various instruments at the national and local levels to establish a level playing field.

### (2) A long-term planning scheme is needed for WH and RE in DH.

Currently, the nation heavily relies on natural gas during the initial stage of the heating transition. However, RE has become an unavoidable choice to meet the national carbon neutrality goal by 2060. The current RE target is insufficient and must move away from fossil "Clean Energy" –natural gas and coal. Additionally, raising awareness about the best available RE technologies is essential. Technical assistance programmes and streamlined authorization procedures for RE are required to achieve the 2060 target.

#### (3) A deeper understanding of WH sources is required.

The current policies mainly support WH sources from thermal and nuclear power plants as well as energy-intensive industries such as iron and steel. Despite the mentioned conventional WH sources of abundant potential for the Chinese DH system, there are more potential sources that can also be quite relevant. For example, excess heat from datacentres [150], metro stations, food retails, wastewater treatment plants,



(a)



Fig. 11. Number of journal articles on district heating in China published in Chinese journals during 2010–2022. (a) Number of articles by year; (b) Number of articles by topics.

supermarkets as well as power-to-X (PtX) plants [8,151].

#### (4) More concrete goals are needed for WH and RE in DH.

Both the national and local level strategies lack clearly defined goals regarding the share of RE and WH in the overall heating structure and different types of heating systems, i.e., existing, expanded, and new DH systems. The existing goals for the entire heating sector fail to specify the share within the DH system. In addition, the level of integration and the priority of the various competitive heat resources RE vs. WH shall also be considered carefully, which requires further knowledge on the long-term energy planning considering the synergies among various energy sectors under the Smart Energy Systems concept as well as the efficiency improvement of both DH networks and buildings.

# (5) Supporting policies on integrating RE and WH in the heating sector in general are also needed.

The current focus on integrating RE into the national energy system in China predominantly centres around electricity in general, while heating has not received sufficient attention and supportive policies in this regard compared to electricity. For instance, the policy on energy consumption points out that the electricity consumption from RE sources of each province will only be evaluated based on energy intensity, but will exclude the assessment of the total amount of consumption. Given the fundamental role of renewable electricity in achieving climate targets, while it is inevitable to highlight the deployment of RE in the electricity sector, it is still important to know that the national policy shall not overlook the capacity of the heating sector in terms of decarbonisation using RE and WH. from a system perspective.

#### (6) Greater attention should be given to southern areas in China.

The national heating development plan and financial support measures exclusively focus on areas located north of the North-South heating line. Expansion opportunities could be available throughout China, without being limited by zoning. There is significant potential for RE and WH in the hot summer and cold winter regions of southern China. Detailed mapping is needed to identify heat demand and supply resources in Southern China, supporting decision-making at the local, regional, and national levels.

# (7) More efforts are required on the reform of heat metering and charging.

Though the introduction of the meter-based heat charging system as a replacement of the building floor area-based charging system has been proposed in China for many years, less progress is achieved. In 2022, nine ministries issued [149] *"Establish and Improve the Implementation Plan of Carbon Peak and Carbon Neutral Standard Measurement System"*, which put forward essential standards that can be used in various sectors at all levels, including the energy sector. However, the description of the standard and the measurement system in relation to the heating system, both DH and household individual heating, is lacking in this implementation plan.

#### 5.2. Research gaps and future directions

Based on the evidence from both international and domestic journals in China, it is founded that the overall DH systems in China have been well and widely studied. The research interests have been growing in recent years in terms of the various kinds of RE and WH sources. Nevertheless, some key gaps are still found and can potentially be the direction for further studies.

First and foremost, there is considerable potential for further promoting the adoption of 4GDH in China, which could improve the energy efficiency of the Chinese DH systems by allowing more efficient use of, e. g., HPs and low-temperature WH as well as reducing DH grid losses [8–10]. Considering the dual carbon goals in China, it becomes crucial to reduce energy intensity and enhance overall energy efficiency. The extensive literature on European countries like Denmark [8], Norway [155], Latvia [156] and so on has affirmed the benefits of 4GDH in terms of sector coupling, energy conservation, facilitating renewable energy integration, and environmental advantages. Encouragement should be given to bolster research efforts in the field of 4GDH in China.

Moreover, to the best of the author's knowledge, the current investigations on sector coupling have primarily focused on the integration between the electricity and heating sectors. However, there is a lack of studies conducted under the context of Smart Energy Systems [12,14], which encompasses all sectors of the energy system, including electricity, heating, industry, and transportation. This would enable the utilisation of low-temperature WH from the other sectors, such as the excess heat from the PtX plants that produce sustainable methanol and ammonia for the industry and transportation sectors.

The potential of these plants is still uncertain as the WH potential and temperature levels depend on the type of technology used and their geographical proximity to the DH grids. However, existing studies have already demonstrated the potential; e.g., a study for Denmark finds that WH from these sources could deliver more than 5% of the national DH production of Denmark [9]. Replicating the exact level of WH utilisation from other countries in China can be challenging due to variations in urban scale, land availability, types, and distribution of WH sources, as well as climate conditions. Nevertheless, the methodologies and concepts employed can provide valuable references for future research conducted in the Chinese context.

Also, the current focus on WH integration primarily revolves energyintensive industries and power plants. This trend is also evident in national policies, as discussed in Section 3.2. Notably, there are only two publications addressing WH recovery from data centres [99,100]. To gain a comprehensive understanding of WH utilisation in Chinese DH, it is crucial to explore the potential and implementation of various low-temperature WH sources, e.g., supermarkets, metro stations and wastewater treatment plants, which warrants further investigation within the academic domain [8,157,158]. These sources become more relevant for DH as the grid temperatures are reduced, and they provide a higher temperature energy source for HPs than, e.g., air or seawater, resulting in a more efficient energy system.

Also, more importantly, despite the fact that a business scale has not been realized at present, the WH recovery from cutting-edge power-to-X (PtX) technologies is an abundant and valuable asset for the future highshare RE-based energy system [43]. The production of green hydrogen and green liquid fuel (e.g., methanol and ammonia) and gas are foreseen to be the trend to decarbonise the hard-to-abate sectors, especially industries [34,41] and transportation [152,153] in the future. With the boosting domestic hydrogen industry in China outlined in the National Hydrogen Industry Development Plan (2021–2035) [154], the WH recovery potential from electrolysers is expected to be on the way. Despite the uncertainty on the level of WH utilisation, which is contingent on the type of electrolysers chosen, it is anticipated that relevant studies from both academia and industries will help bridge the gap and capture emerging trends.

Some of the other gaps are, for example, further research to map the heat demands and assess the WH and RE potentials specifically in southern China. A thorough techno-economic energy system analysis is necessary to establish an informed foundation for developing DH planning across the entire country. These studies will provide valuable insights into the potential heat sources, including WH and RE integration, enabling more effective and efficient DH planning and implementation strategies.

#### 6. Conclusions

This study provides a systematic review and assessment of the current status, policy framework, and scientific literature concerning the integration of RE and WH in DH systems in China. It is found out that, DH is currently the primary approach to fulfil the heating demands in the urban regions of Northern China. Despite the considerable RE and WH potential in China, the prevailing DH system relies on coal, resulting in environmental and health concerns. The primary technical obstacles include the uneven geographical distribution of RE and WH sources nationwide, the temporal mismatch between heat production and demanding points, and the potential challenges associated with further expanding the DH network in certain southern areas.

A comprehensive policy review revealed that the policy advancements in China concerning RE and WH in DH systems can be categorized into three stages: pre-2017, 2017-2021, and post-2021, according to the timeline. The emphasis on RE and WH in the heating sector, particularly from a policy perspective, began following the announcement of China's dual carbon goals in 2020. Prior to this, the focus had long been on phasing out coal without presenting ambitious targets for the integration of RE and WH. Also, despite still under the developmental stage, there is growing attention on the southern regions of China, particularly central and southwest China, which have been excluded from the national heating plan traditionally due to relatively lower demand compared to northern regions. The findings from the policy review highlight the importance of urging to enhance the policy support and to set concrete goals for the integration of RE and WH in DH systems. Instead of only focusing on the single heating or power sector, achieving the dual carbon goals necessitates the collaboration among all sectors of the energy landscape in society to create a long-term national energy plan so as to maximize efficiency through synergies among sectors, which is also the key element of the Smart Energy Systems concept.

To offer a thorough understanding from a scientific standpoint and to track emerging trends as well as the research gaps, a comprehensive literature review was carried out from 2010 to 2022 specifically focusing on the topic of DH in China. The review identified 268 and 285 academic articles published in international journals and domestic journals written in Chinese, respectively. The results show that the understanding of WH sources is primarily focused on the energy-intensive industries and heat recovery from thermal power stations, while only limited attention has been paid to the significant future WH potential from the emerging energy conversion processes such as biogas plants and PtX plants. Besides, great potential was identified for the further exploration of the 4th generation district heating and smart energy systems in the Chinese context to enhance local knowledge. Also, in response to the existing technical and policy challenges, a more holistic approach to identifying the local resources and heat demands around the nation, especially the southern China, is necessary to be able to make relevant decisions to move forward towards carbon neutrality.

#### CRediT authorship contribution statement

Meng Yuan: Conceptualization, Data curation, Formal analysis, Investigation, Methodology, Visualization, Writing – original draft, Writing – review & editing. Brian Vad Mathiesen: Conceptualization, Funding acquisition, Supervision, Writing – review & editing. Noémi Schneider: Conceptualization, Formal analysis, Writing – original draft, Writing – review & editing. Jianjun Xia: Data curation, Writing – review & editing. Wen Zheng: Data curation, Formal analysis, Visualization, Writing – original draft. Peter Sorknæs: Funding acquisition, Writing – review & editing. Henrik Lund: Writing – review & editing. Lipeng Zhang: Data curation, Writing – review & editing.

#### Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial

interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

#### Data availability

No data was used for the research described in the article.

#### Acknowledgements

The work presented in this paper is supported by the Sino-Danish Strategic Sector Cooperation for Clean Heating in China; IEA-DHC Annex TS5 "Integration of Renewable Energy Sources into District Heating and Cooling Systems" and TS7 "Industry-DHC Symbiosis" funded by the Energy Technology Development and Demonstration Programme (EUDP) under no. 134223–497128 and no. 64020–2026; and REWARDHeat - Renewable and Waste Heat Recovery for Competitive District Heating and Cooling Networks funded by the European Union Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement 857811. The study was first presented at the 18th International Symposium on District Heating and Cooling (DHC2023) in Beijing in September 2023, and this paper is an extensive version of the original conference paper. The authors would especially like to thank Mette Reiche Sørensen for her help in proofreading.

#### Appendix A

Table A1Major national policies, regulations, and supporting frameworks on district heating in China.

Year	Ministry	Title	Key points	Conventional heat sources	RE & WH sources	Building efficiency	DH system renovation, expansion, & operation	Thermal storage	Metering	Pricing & financing
2003	Eight ministries (MOC, NDRC, etc.)	Guiding Opinions on the Pilot Reform of the Urban Heating Structure	Stopping welfare heating and implementing heat commercialisation						✓	1
2007	NDRC	The 11 <sup>th</sup> Five- Year Plan for Energy Development (2006–2010)	Promoting CHP; Switch from distributed boilers to centralised heating; 40% urban heating area covered by DH system	/						
2007	Central Government	Energy Conservation Law of the People's Republic of China	Implementing household heat metering for DH building step-by- step						1	
2010	MOHURD	Design Standard for Energy Efficiency of Residential Buildings in Severe Cold and Cold Zones (JGJ 26–2010)	The new residential buildings with heating demand are required to save 65% energy based on 1980 to 1981 level.			7				
2012	NDRC	The 12th Five- Year Plan for Energy Development (2011–2015)	Promoting of gas co-generation	J						
2013	NEA, MOHURD, MOF, MLR	Guiding Opinions on Promoting the Development and Utilisation	Promoting geothermal heating where resources are available		1					

Year	Ministry	Title	Key points	Conventional heat sources	RE & WH sources	Building efficiency	DH system renovation, expansion, & operation	Thermal storage	Metering	Pricing & financing
		of Geothermal								
0015	NDDC	Energy	0000 to		,					
2015	NDRC	Plan of Waste	2020 target:		~					
		Heat Utilisation	waste heat							
			resources for space							
			heating for more							
			and reducing coal							
			for heating by							
			more than 50							
2016	NDDC	En ourse Gunnla	million tons.		,					
2016	NDRC	and	beating and		~					
		Consumption	implementing							
		Revolution	geothermal where							
		Strategy	resource							
		(2010–2030)	suitable							
2016	NEA	The 13 <sup>th</sup> Five-	Promoting		1					
		Year Plan for	renewable energy							
		Energy	utilisation in rural							
		(2016-2020)	areas.							
2016	NDRC	The 13 <sup>th</sup> Five-	2020 target: solar		1					
		Year Plan for	heating collector							
		Renewable	area 800 million $m^2$ goothermal							
		Development	heating 1172 PJ.							
		(2016–2020)	and biomass							
			heating 440 PJ.							
			Various types of							
			heating and civil							
			fuels will replace a							
0016	NIEA	The 10 <sup>th</sup> Fire	total of 3296 PJ.		,					
2016	NEA	Year Plan for	2020 target: solar		~					
		Solar Energy	area 800 million							
		Development	m <sup>2</sup> .							
2016	NDBC	(2016–2020) Administrativa	Encouraging	/	,					
2010	NDRC	Measure for	utilisation of clean	•	v					
		Combined Heat	and renewable							
		and Power	energy for heating,							
		Plants	including excess							
			pressure, biomass,							
			geothermal, solar							
			energy, and							
			Promoting the							
			application of IEH							
		. eh	and heat pumps.							
2017	NDRC	The 13 <sup>th</sup> Five-	2020 target: total							
		Geothermal	cooling area by							
		Energy	geothermal 1.6							
		Development	billion m <sup>2</sup> .							
2017	NDRC NEA	(2016–2020) Guiding	2020 target		1					
2017	INDIC, INEA	Opinions on	biomass CHP 12		v					
		Promoting the	million KW, BMF							
		Development of	30 million tons,							
		Biomass-based	biogas 10 billion							
		ricat supply	heating area 1							
			billion m <sup>2</sup> .							
			2035 target:							
			DIOMASS CHP 25 million KW BMF							
			50 million tons,							
			biogas 25 billion							

(continueu)										
Year	Ministry	Title	Key points	Conventional heat sources	RE & WH sources	Building efficiency	DH system renovation, expansion, & operation	Thermal storage	Metering	Pricing & financing
			m <sup>3</sup> , total bioenergy heating area 2 billion m <sup>2</sup>				-			
2017	MOHURD	The 13 <sup>th</sup> Five- Year Plan for Buildings Energy Saving and Green Building Development	Expanding the scale of renewable energy building applications.			1				
2017	NDRC, NEA, MOF, MEE, MOHURD, SASAC, AQSIQ, CBRC, CSRC, LSCMC	Clean Winter Heating Plan in Northern China (2017–2021)	<ul> <li>2021 overall target: clean heating area in north China reaches 70%, replacing bulk coal 0.15 billion tons.</li> <li>Geothermal heating area (billion m<sup>2</sup>): shallow geothermal 0.5 and hydrothermal 0.5.</li> <li>Biomass heating area (billion m<sup>2</sup>): total 2.1, including biomass CHP 1, urban household waste CHP 0.5, BMF 0.5, and biogas 0.1).</li> <li>Solar heating area: 50 million m<sup>2</sup>.</li> <li>IWH heating area: 0.2 billion m<sup>2</sup>.</li> <li>IWH heating area: 1.8 billion m<sup>2</sup> during 2017–2021 in "2 + 26" cities <sup>a</sup>.</li> <li>Electricity heating area (billion m<sup>2</sup>): total 1.5, including distributed heating 0.7, electric boilers 0.3, and heat pumps 0.5.</li> <li>Clean coal district heating</li> </ul>							
2017	MOF, MOHURD, MEE, NEA	Notification of Implementing Central Financial Support for Pilots of Clean Heating in	area: 11 billion m <sup>2</sup> . Financial support for 43 clean heating pilot cities with 0.5–1 billion RMB/city/year.							J
2017	NDRC	Northern China Opinions on Pricing Policy of Clean Heating in Northern China	• Improving electricity and gas pricing policies to							1
			Policies to						(continued o	n next page)

Year	Ministry	Title	Key points	Conventional heat sources	RE & WH sources	Building efficiency	DH system renovation, expansion, & operation	Thermal storage	Metering	Pricing & financing
			support "coal-to- electricity" and "coal-to-gas" reform Establish a sound price mechanism of heating							
			according to local conditions	,	,					
2018	NEA	Launching Country-level Clean Heating Demonstration	Launching 136 demonstration projects in 20 provinces.	<i>,</i>	<b>v</b>					
		Project of Biomass Cogeneration in "100 Towns"	<ul> <li>Installed CHP capacity:3.8 million KW.</li> <li>Annual consumption of agricultural and</li> </ul>							
			forestry waste and household waste: 36 million tons. • Supply residential							
			heating area: 90 million m <sup>2</sup> , and Industrial heating: 69 million GL							
2018	MOHURD	Design Standard for Energy Efficiency of Residential Buildings in Severe Cold and Cold Zones	The new residential buildings with heating demand are required to save 75% energy based on 1980 to			7				
2021	NEA	(JGJ26-2018) Notification of Implementing Renewable Energy Heating	1981 level. Provides guiding instructions on promoting renewable energy		1					
		Suitable to Local Conditions	<ul><li>heating based on six aspects:</li><li>Scientific-based planning</li></ul>							
			<ul> <li>Suitable local conditions</li> <li>Promoting pilot demonstration projects</li> </ul>							
			<ul> <li>Guaranteeing supportive policies</li> <li>Strengthening</li> </ul>							
			<ul> <li>R&amp;D support for key technologies</li> <li>Improving the government management</li> </ul>							
2021	NEA	Several Opinions on Promoting the Development and Utilisation of Geothermal Energy	system Overall target in geothermal heating: • 2025 target: 50% increase in geothermal heating		1					
			(cooling) area compared to 2020							

Year	Ministry	Title	Key points	Conventional heat sources	RE & WH sources	Building efficiency	DH system renovation, expansion,	Thermal storage	Metering	Pricing & financing
							& operation			
			<ul> <li>2035 target: double the</li> </ul>							
			geothermal							
			heating							
			(cooling) area							
			capacity of							
			geothermal							
			power							
			generation							
			2025.							
			Promote the							
			utilisation of							
			geothermal							
			heating.							
			Region of							
			Beijing-Tianjin- Hebei-Shanxi-							
			Shandong-							
			Henan and the							
			Yangtze River Basin: promote							
			geothermal							
			heating and							
			cooling consid-							
			demands.							
			Yunnan and							
			Guizhou: using							
			energy to meet							
			the increasing							
			heating demand							
			China							
			<ul> <li>Adopting</li> </ul>							
			surface water							
			source, and							
			groundwater							
			source heat							
			suitable.							
			Promote the							
			medium-depth							
			ing in Beijing-							
			Tianjin-Hebei,							
			Shanxi, Shandong,							
			Oinghai, Hei-							
			longjiang, Jilin,							
			Liaoning and other							
			regions, consid-							
			of the sources and							
			the market							
2022	NRDC NFA	The 14 <sup>th</sup> Five-	<ul> <li>demands.</li> <li>Boost the</li> </ul>							
29 Jan	11120, 1121	Year Plan for the	research and				•			
		Development of	development of							
		New Energy Storage	key technology							
		Storage	of thermal (cold)							
			energy storage.							
			<ul> <li>Promote short- medium tarm</li> </ul>							
			high-efficiency							
			thermal energy							
			storage,							
			including daily,							

Year	Ministry	Title	Key points	Conventional heat sources	RE & WH sources	Building efficiency	DH system renovation, expansion, & operation	Thermal storage	Metering	Pricing & financing
Year 2022 29 Jan	Ministry NRDC, NEA	Title The 14 <sup>th</sup> Five- Year Plan for the Modern Energy System	<ul> <li>Key points</li> <li>weekly, and seasonal.</li> <li>Promote CHP transformation and comprehensive utilisation of industrial WH and pressure in Northern region. Gradually phase out small coal boilers and dispersed coal within the coverage of the DH network.</li> <li>Promote new electric heating equipment such as air source heat pumps, and thermal storage electric boilers according to local conditions.</li> <li>Promote the comprehensive utilisation of nuclear energy in clean heating, industrial heating, seawater desalination and other fields.</li> <li>Develop geothermal heating and cooling where suitable.</li> <li>Build an intelligent and efficient energy operation system and explore coordinated scheduling of multiple energy systems, i.e., electricity, heat, and natural gas.</li> <li>Implement clean heating electricity price, gas price, heat price and other policies.</li> </ul>	Conventional heat sources	RE & WH sources	Building efficiency	✓	Thermal storage	Metering	Pricing & financing ✓
		industry development (2021–2035)	nydrogen, electricity, and thermal energy system for a modern energy supply system that is multi- complementary and integrated.						(continued o	n next page)

Year	Ministry	Title	Key points	Conventional heat sources	RE & WH sources	Building efficiency	DH system renovation, expansion, & operation	Thermal storage	Metering	Pricing & financing
2022 May	NRDC, NEA	Implementation plan for promoting the high-quality development of new energy in the new era	<ul> <li>Encourage public institutions to install PV or solar thermal utilisation facilities in existing buildings.</li> <li>Promote clean heating in rural areas and clean agricultural production. Promote biomass, geothermal, and solar heating according to local conditions. Replace dispersed coal with new energy on the basis of ensuring safe and stable</li> </ul>		*					
2022 June	NDRC, NEA, MOF,MNR, MEE, MOHURD, MOA, CMA, NFGA	The 14 <sup>th</sup> Five- Year Plan for Renewable Energy Development	and stable energy supply. 2025 target: Non- electric renewable energy utilisation reaches more than 60 million tonnes of coal equivalent, including geothermal and biomass heating, biomass fuel, and solar thermal energy utilisation. • Upgrade biomass power generation to cogeneration and provide DH for densely populated villages as well as small- medium-size in- dustrial parks according to local conditions. Encourage the use of large-		,		,			
			<ul> <li>act of large- medium-size</li> <li>biomass boilers</li> <li>for DH in cities</li> <li>and towns. Pro- mote the house- hold molding</li> <li>fuel heating</li> <li>stoves in rural</li> <li>areas in the non- key region for</li> <li>air pollution</li> <li>control.</li> <li>Promote</li> <li>medium and</li> <li>deep geothermal</li> <li>heating in the</li> <li>northern region</li> <li>depending on</li> </ul>							

(continued)										
Year	Ministry	Title	Key points	Conventional heat sources	RE & WH sources	Building efficiency	DH system renovation, expansion, & operation	Thermal storage	Metering	Pricing & financing
							a operation			
			and market demands							
			Promote the use							
			of shallow							
			geothermal							
			energy in the							
			North China Plain and the							
			Yangtze River							
			Economic Belt							
			which have both							
			heating and							
			cooling needs,							
			the use of							
			ground source							
			heat pumps,							
			then the							
			recycled water							
			source heat							
			moderately							
			develop surface							
			water source							
			heat pumps.							
			Promote the							
			and utilisation							
			of geothermal							
			energy in							
			southern alpine							
			regions such as							
			Yunnan and							
			Promote							
			biomass,							
			geothermal,							
			solar, and							
			electric heating							
			area according							
			to local							
			conditions.							
			<ul> <li>Coordinate the</li> </ul>							
			planning,							
			construction,							
			and renovation							
			infrastructure.							
			and establish a							
			heating system							
			in which RE and							
			conventional							
			energy are							
			and cascaded.							
			Improve the							
			compatibility of							
			the DH pipe							
			network with							
			the integration							
			geothermal							
			energy.							
			<ul> <li>Develop district</li> </ul>							
			comprehensive							
			energy services							
			based on the							
			smart power							
			and DH							
			network.							
									(continued of	n next page)

Year	Ministry	Title	Key points	Conventional heat sources	RE & WH sources	Building efficiency	DH system renovation, expansion, & operation	Thermal storage	Metering	Pricing & financing
2022 June	MEE, NDRC, MIIT, MOHURD, MOT,MOA, NEA	Implementation Plan for the Synergy Efficiency Improvement in Pollution and Carbon Reduction	<ul> <li>Promote the simultaneous implementation of building energy-saving renovation and clean heating in northern regions.</li> <li>Give priority to supporting key areas of air pollution control to use RE such as solar energy, geothermal, and biomass to meet the building demands of heating, cooling, and domestic hot water.</li> <li>Promote thermal energy utilisation technologies such as sludge biogas cogeneration in sewage treatment plants and water source heat</li> </ul>		1					
2022 July	MOHURD, NDRC	Implementation Plan for Carbon Peaking in Urban and Rural Construction	pumps. • Targets for building efficiency improvement: In 2025, new buildings in urban area shall fully implement green building standards. The star-rated green buildings will reach more than 30%, and all newly built government- invested public welfare build- ings and large public build- ings and large public build- ings shall be rated more than one star. In 2030, the main body of newly built resi- dential buildings in severe cold and cold regions shall meet the energy saving requirements of 83%, and that for regions of hot summer and warm winter, and mild areas is 75% - The new							

(continued)										
Year	Ministry	Title	Key points	Conventional heat sources	RE & WH sources	Building efficiency	DH system renovation, expansion, & operation	Thermal storage	Metering	Pricing & financing
			public buildings							
			shall meet the							
			requirements of							
			78% energy sav-							
			the construction							
			of zero-carbon							
			buildings and							
			near-zero energy							
			buildings.							
			<ul> <li>Targets for DH</li> <li>network</li> </ul>							
			efficiency:							
			implement							
			renovation for							
			DH pipe							
			network for							
			vears. By 2030.							
			the heat loss of							
			the DH pipe							
			network will be							
			reduced by 5%							
			2020							
			Promote the							
			application of							
			solar thermal							
			buildings in							
			solar energy							
			resources and in							
			buildings with							
			stable DHW							
			demand.							
			<ul> <li>Promote the application of</li> </ul>							
			geothermal and							
			biomass heating							
			as well as heat							
			pump							
			technologies.							
			<ul> <li>comprehensive utilisation the</li> </ul>							
			WH from heat							
			and power							
			cogeneration,							
			industries, and							
			according to the							
			actual							
			conditions of							
			each region.							
			Guide ultra-low							
			in cold regions							
			no longer con-							
			nect to munic-							
			ipal DH.							
			Promote RE							
			heating in rural							
			Accelerate							
			heating							
			metering and							
			pricing							
			according to the							
			amount of heat							
2022 July	MOHURD	The 14 <sup>th</sup> Five-	<ul> <li>Reduce the heat</li> </ul>	1	1	1				
	NDRC	Year Plan for	loss of the DH	-	-					
		National Urban	pipe network							
			and the energy							

(continued on next page)

#### (continued)

Year	Ministry	Title	Key points	Conventional heat sources	RE & WH sources	Building efficiency	DH system renovation, expansion, & operation	Thermal storage	Metering	Pricing & financing
2022 June	MOST, NDRC, MIIT, MEE, MOHURD, MOT, CAS, CAE, NEA	Infrastructure Construction Implementation Plan for Science and Technology to Support Carbon Peaking and Carbon Neutrality (2022–2030)	<ul> <li>consumption per unit building area.</li> <li>Accelerate the renovation of the old DH pipe networks and substations.</li> <li>Promote low- carbon heat re- sources, including co- generation, RE heating, indus- trial WH, natu- ral gas and electricity heating.</li> <li>Research development for network</li> <li>connecting of new energy, thermal power and industrial WH, and long-distance DH technology.</li> <li>Develop new technologies for co-generation, co- supply and inter- seasonal co-storage of water and heat for the utilisation of WH from nuclear power plants in the northern coastal</li> </ul>		1					

Note: NEA: National Energy Administration; NDRC: National Development and Reform Commission; MOHURD: Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development; MEE: Ministry of Ecology and Environment; MOC: Ministry of Construction; MOF: Ministry of Finance; MNR: Ministry of Natural Resources; MOA: Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs; CMA: China Meteorological Administration; NFGA: National Forestry and Grassland Administration; MIIT: Ministry of Industry and Information Technology; MOT: Ministry of Transport; MOST: Ministry of Science and Technology; CAS: Chinese Academy of Sciences; CAE: Chinese Academy of Engineering; SASAC: State-owned Assets Supervision and Administration Commission of the State Council; AQSIQ: General Administration of Quality Supervision, Inspection and Quarantine; CBRC: China Banking Regulatory Commission; CSRC: China Securities Regulatory Commission; LSCMC: The Logistic Support Department of the Central Military Commission.

<sup>a</sup> The "2 + 26" cities are the important cities located at the air pollution transmission channel of the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region, which include Beijing, Tianjin, 8 cities in Hebei Province (i.e., Shijiazhuang, Tangshan, Langfang, Baoding, Cangzhou, Hengshui, Xingtai, Handan), 4 cities in Shanxi Province (i.e., Taiyuan, Yangquan, Changzhi, Jincheng), 7 cities in Shandong Province (i.e., Jinan, Zibo, Jining, Dezhou, Liaocheng, Binzhou, Heze), and 7 cities of Henan Province (i.e., Zhengzhou, Kaifeng, Anyang, Hebi, Xinxiang, Jiaozuo, and Puyang).

#### References

- International Energy Agency. Heat 2023. https://www.iea.org/reports/heating. [Accessed 11 October 2023].
- Werner S. International review of district heating and cooling. Energy 2017;137: 617–31. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ENERGY.2017.04.045.
- [3] International Energy Agency. What is the role of district heating in clean energy transitions? n.d. https://www.iea.org/energy-system/buildings/district-h eating#tracking (accessed October 12, 2023).
- [4] Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development. Statistical Yearbook of urban and rural construction 2010-2022. 2023.
- [5] Liu R, Xia J. Current situation and demand for urban heating in China. In: Open forum of 19th "Tsinghua university building energy conservation academic week" : pathways for China's urban energy supply system to achieve carbon neutrality; 2023 (in Chinese).
- [6] National Bureau of Statistics. China energy statistical yearbook 2022. Beijing, China: China Statistics Press; 2022.
- [7] IRENA and Aalborg University. Integrating low-temperature renewables in district energy systems: guidelines for policy makers. 2021. Abu Dhabi, Copenhagen.

- [8] Sorknæs P, Østergaard PA, Thellufsen JZ, Lund H, Nielsen S, Djørup S, et al. The benefits of 4th generation district heating in a 100% renewable energy system. Energy 2020;213:119030. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2020.119030.
- [9] Sorknæs P, Nielsen S, Lund H, Mathiesen BV, Moreno D, Thellufsen JZ. The benefits of 4th generation district heating and energy efficient datacentres. Energy 2022;260:125215. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ENERGY.2022.125215.
- [10] Lund H, Østergaard PA, Chang M, Werner S, Svendsen S, Sorknæs P, et al. The status of 4th generation district heating: research and results. Energy 2018;164: 147–59. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ENERGY.2018.08.206.
- [11] Lund H, Werner S, Wiltshire R, Svendsen S, Thorsen JE, Hvelplund F, et al. 4th Generation District Heating (4GDH): integrating smart thermal grids into future sustainable energy systems. Energy 2014;68:1–11. https://doi.org/10.1016/J. ENERGY.2014.02.089.
- [12] Lund H, Østergaard PA, Connolly D, Mathiesen BV. Smart energy and smart energy systems. Energy 2017;137:556–65. https://doi.org/10.1016/J. ENERGY.2017.05.123.
- [13] Lund H, Østergaard PA, Nielsen TB, Werner S, Thorsen JE, Gudmundsson O, et al. Perspectives on fourth and fifth generation district heating. Energy 2021;227: 120520. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ENERGY.2021.120520.

- [14] Yuan M, Thellufsen JZ, Lund H, Liang Y. The electrification of transportation in energy transition. Energy 2021;236:121564. https://doi.org/10.1016/J. ENERGY.2021.121564.
- [15] Yuan M, Sorknæs P, Lund H, Liang Y. The bidding strategies of large-scale battery storage in 100% renewable smart energy systems. Appl Energy 2022;326:119960. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.APENERGY.2022.119960.
- [16] Zhang L, Li Y, Zhang H, Xu X, Yang Z, Xu W. A review of the potential of district heating system in Northern China. Appl Therm Eng 2021;188. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.applthermaleng.2021.116605.
- [17] Zhang Z, Zhou Y, Zhao N, Li H, Tohniyaz B, Mperejekumana P, et al. Clean heating during winter season in Northern China: a review. Renew Sustain Energy Rev 2021;149:111339. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.RSER.2021.111339.
- [18] Su C, Madani H, Palm B. Heating solutions for residential buildings in China: current status and future outlook. Energy Convers Manag 2018;177:493–510. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ENCONMAN.2018.10.005.
- [19] Gong M, Werner S. An assessment of district heating research in China. Renew Energy 2017;84. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.renene.2015.05.061.
- [20] Huang J, Fan J, Furbo S. Feasibility study on solar district heating in China. Renew Sustain Energy Rev 2019;108:53–64. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. rser.2019.03.014.
- [21] Xu YS, Wang XW, Shen SL, Zhou A. Distribution characteristics and utilization of shallow geothermal energy in China. Energy Build 2020;229:110479. https://doi. org/10.1016/j.enbuild.2020.110479.
- [22] Yuan Y, Cao X, Sun L, Lei B, Yu N. Ground source heat pump system: a review of simulation in China. Renew Sustain Energy Rev 2012;16:6814–22. https://doi. org/10.1016/J.RSER.2012.07.025.
- [23] Shen C, Lei Z, Wang Y, Zhang C, Yao Y. A review on the current research and application of wastewater source heat pumps in China. Therm Sci Eng Prog 2018; 6:140–56. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.TSEP.2018.03.007.
- [24] Li Y, Chang S, Fu L, Zhang S. A technology review on recovering waste heat from the condensers of large turbine units in China. Renew Sustain Energy Rev 2016; 58:287–96. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2015.12.059.
- [25] Zhou X, Xu Y, Zhang X, Xu D, Linghu Y, Guo H, et al. Large scale underground seasonal thermal energy storage in China. J Energy Storage 2021;33:102026. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.est.2020.102026.
- [26] Jiang Y. The important task of zero-carbon heating to achieve carbon neutrality. 2023 (in Chinese), http://www.china-heating.org.cn/electure/832300200.html. [Accessed 12 October 2023].
- [27] Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development. Code for thermal design of civil building GB 50176-2016. 2016. China.
- [28] Guo J, Huang Y, Wei C. North-South debate on district heating: evidence from a household survey. Energy Pol 2015;86:295–302. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. enpol.2015.07.017.
- [29] China District Heating Association. China urban heating development report 2022. China Architecture & Building Press; 2023.
- [30] MOHURD, NDRC. 14th Five-Year Plan for National Urban Infrastructure Construction 2022. https://www.mohurd.gov.cn/gongkai/zhengce/zhengcefileli b/202207/20220729\_767388.html. [Accessed 30 May 2023].
- [31] IEA. District energy systems in China. 2017. https://www.iea.org/reports/district-energy-systems-in-china. [Accessed 1 November 2023].
- [32] Zhang Y, Zheng W, Fang H, Xia J. Clean heating in Northern China: regional investigations and roadmap studies for urban area towards 2050. J Clean Prod 2022;334:130233. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.JCLEPRO.2021.130233.
  [33] Yuan M, Thellufsen JZ, Sorknæs P, Lund H, Liang Y. District heating in 100%
- [33] Yuan M, Thellufsen JZ, Sorknæs P, Lund H, Liang Y. District heating in 100% renewable energy systems: combining industrial excess heat and heat pumps. Energy Convers Manag 2021;244:114527. https://doi.org/10.1016/J. ENCONMAN.2021.114527.
- [34] Mathiesen BV, Johannsen RM, Kermeli K, Crijns-Graus W, Lund H, Skov IR. The green transition of industry – an introduction to IndustryPLAN. Smart Energy 2023;11:100111. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.SEGY.2023.100111.
- [35] Lygnerud K, Werner S. Risk assessment of industrial excess heat recovery in district heating systems. Energy 2018;151:430–41. https://doi.org/10.1016/J. ENERGY.2018.03.047.
- [36] Clean Heating Industry Committee. Research report on biomass clean heating in northern China. 2021 (in Chinese).
- [37] China Coal Cap Project. China dispersed coal management report. 2020.
- [38] Lund H, Skov IR, Thellufsen JZ, Sorknæs P, Korberg AD, Chang M, et al. The role of sustainable bioenergy in a fully decarbonised society. Renew Energy 2022;196: 195–203. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.RENENE.2022.06.026.
- [39] Xing X, Wang R, Bauer N, Ciais P, Cao J, Chen J, et al. Spatially explicit analysis identifies significant potential for bioenergy with carbon capture and storage in China. Nat Commun 2021;12:3159. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-021-23282x
- [40] Wang R, Cai W, Yu L, Li W, Zhu L, Cao B, et al. A high spatial resolution dataset of China's biomass resource potential. Sci Data 2023;10:384. https://doi.org/ 10.1038/s41597-023-02227-7.
- [41] Yuan M, Liu C, Wang B, Shang W, Zhang H. Accelerating the net zero transition in Asia and the Pacific: low-carbon hydrogen for industrial decarbonization. Hydrogen in Decarbonization Strategies in Asia and the Pacific 2023:1–26. https://doi.org/10.56506/JPUT8568.
- [42] Johannsen RM, Mathiesen BV, Kermeli K, Crijns-Graus W, Østergaard PA. Exploring pathways to 100% renewable energy in European industry. Energy 2023;268:126687. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ENERGY.2023.126687.
- [43] Lund H, Thellufsen JZ, Sorknæs P, Mathiesen BV, Chang M, Madsen PT, et al. Smart energy Denmark. A consistent and detailed strategy for a fully

decarbonized society. Renew Sustain Energy Rev 2022;168:112777. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.RSER.2022.112777.

- [44] Gao J, Dai X. China's geothermal direct utilization scale ranks first in the world. Xinhua News Agency; 2023.
- [45] Pang Z. District heating & cooling by geothermal energy: new technology and application in karst geothermal reservoirs for industrial-scale development in China. 2021. https://irena.org/-/media/Files/IRENA/Agency/Events/2021/Ma r/District-Energy-Systems-China/Session-II/English/3-Prof-Zhonghe-PANG-chinaNew-technology-geothermal-in-China.pdf?la=en&hash=C4999C7EDF0CE 439A1D698F73285BB68DDF4D592&hash=C4999C7EDF0CE439A1D698F.
- [46] Zhu J, Hu K, Lu X, Huang X, Liu K, Wu X. A review of geothermal energy resources, development, and applications in China: current status and prospects. Energy 2015;93:466–83. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2015.08.098.
- [47] Zhu J, Hu K, Lu X, Huang X, Liu K, Wu X. A review of geothermal energy resources, development, and applications in China: current status and prospects. Energy 2015;93:466–83. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2015.08.098.
- [48] National Development and Reform Commission. Clean Winter Heating Plan in Northern China (2017-2021) 2017. https://www.ndrc.gov.cn/xxgk/zc fb/tz/201712/W020190905503624116481.pdf.
- [49] NDRC, NEA, MOF, MNR, MEE, MOHURD. The 14th five-year plan for renewable energy development. 2022. https://www.ndrc.gov.cn/xxgk/zcfb/ghwb/20220 6/P020220602315308557623.pdf. [Accessed 30 May 2023].
- [50] Deng J, Wei Q, Liang M, He S, Zhang H. Field test on energy performance of medium-depth geothermal heat pump systems (MD-GHPs). Energy Build 2019; 184:289–99. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ENBUILD.2018.12.006.
- [51] Deng J, Ma M, Wei Q, Liu J, Zhang H, Li M. A specially-designed test platform and method to study the operation performance of medium-depth geothermal heat pump systems (MD-GHPs) in newly-constructed project. Energy Build 2022;272: 112369. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ENBUILD.2022.112369.
- [52] IEA-SHC. China Countr Rep: Status of Solar Heating/Cooling and Solar Buildings-2020 2020. https://www.iea-shc.org/country/china/report. [Accessed 11 February 2021].
- [53] China Solar Thermal Utilization Specialization Committee. 2020 report of solar thermal utilization status in China. 2020.
- [54] Asian Development Bank. Solar district heating in the People's Republic of China. Status and development potential. 2019.
- [55] Solargis. Solar resource maps and GIS data for 180+ countries. 2019. Solar resource maps of China.
- [56] Committee CSTUS. 2020 report of solar thermal utilization status in China. 2020.
   [57] Huang J, Fan J, Furbo S. Potential analysis on solar district heating in China. In:
- (S) Finding 5, Fairb 5, Forchat analysis of solar district freating in child. In: ISES solar world congress 2017 - IEA SHC international conference on solar heating and cooling for buildings and industry 2017, proceedings. International Solar Energy Society; 2017. p. 310–21. https://doi.org/10.18086/ swc.2017.06.07.
- [58] Huang J, Fan J, Furbo S. Feasibility study on solar district heating in China. Renew Sustain Energy Rev 2019;108:53–64. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. rser.2019.03.014.
- [59] Tschopp D, Tian Z, Berberich M, Fan J, Perers B, Furbo S. Large-scale solar thermal systems in leading countries: a review and comparative study of Denmark, China, Germany and Austria. Appl Energy 2020;270:114997. https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.apenergy.2020.114997.
- [60] Mathiesen Kenneth BVH. The role of solar thermal in future energy systems country cases for Germany. 2017. Italy, Austria and Denmark.
  [61] Yuan M, Thellufsen JZ, Lund H, Liang Y. The first feasible step towards clean
- [61] Yuan M, Thellufsen JZ, Lund H, Liang Y. The first feasible step towards clean heating transition in urban agglomeration: a case study of Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region. Energy Convers Manag 2020;223:113282. https://doi.org/10.1016/J. ENCONMAN.2020.113282.
- [62] Yan H, Wang R, Zhang C, Xu Z, Hu B, Shao Z. The role of heat pump in heating decarbonization for China carbon neutrality. Carbon Neutrality 2022;1:40. https://doi.org/10.1007/s43979-022-00038-0.
- [63] David A, Mathiesen BV, Averfalk H, Werner S, Lund H. Heat roadmap Europe: large-scale electric heat pumps in district heating systems. Energies 2017;10. https://doi.org/10.3390/en10040578.
- [64] NDRC, NEA, MOF, MEE, MOHURD, SASAC, et al. Clean Winter Heating Plan in Northern China (2017-2021) 2017. https://www.ndrc.gov.cn/xxgk/zc fb/tz/201712/W020190905503624116481.pdf (accessed June 1, 2023).
- [65] Shuxue X, Yueyue W, Jianhui N, Guoyuan M. 'Coal-to-electricity' project is ongoing in north China. Energy 2020;191:116525. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. energy.2019.116525.
- [66] NDRC. Opinions on pricing policy of clean heating in northern China. 2017. https: //www.ndrc.gov.cn/xxgk/zcfb/tz/201709/t20170925\_962561.html. [Accessed 10 June 2021].
- [67] MOHURD MOF MEE NEA. Notification of implementing central financial support for pilots of clean heating in northern China. 2017.
- [68] National Energy Administration. Notification of implementing renewable energy heating suitable to local conditions. 2021.
- [69] NEA. Several Opinions on promoting the development and utilization of geothermal energy. 2021. http://zfxxgk.nea.gov.cn/2021-09/10/c\_1310210548. htm. [Accessed 1 June 2023].
- [70] NDRC NEA. The 14th five-year plan for the development of new energy storage. 2022. https://www.ndrc.gov.cn/xwdt/tzgg/202203/P02022032155010402092 1.pdf. [Accessed 30 May 2023].
- [71] Sheng X, Duanmu L. Energy saving factors affecting analysis on district heating system with distributed variable frequency speed pumps. Appl Therm Eng 2017; 121:779–90. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.applthermaleng.2017.04.079.

- [72] Shan X, Wang P, Lu W. The reliability and availability evaluation of repairable district heating networks under changeable external conditions. Appl Energy 2017;203:686–95. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apenergy.2017.06.081.
- [73] Zheng X, Sun Q, Wang Y, Zheng L, Gao X, You S, et al. Thermo-hydraulic coupled simulation and analysis of a real large-scale complex district heating network in Tianjin. Energy 2021;236:121389. https://doi.org/10.1016/J. ENERGY.2021.121389.
- [74] Qian M, Yan D, An J, Hong T, Spitler JD. Evaluation of thermal imbalance of ground source heat pump systems in residential buildings in China. Build Simulat 2020;13:585–98. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12273-020-0606-5.
- [75] Wei W, Wang B, Gu H, Ni L, Yao Y. Investigation on the regulating methods of air source heat pump system used for district heating: considering the energy loss caused by frosting and on-off. Energy Build 2021;235. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. enbuild.2021.110731.
- [76] Mi P, Zhang J, Han Y, Guo X. Study on energy efficiency and economic performance of district heating system of energy saving reconstruction with photovoltaic thermal heat pump. Energy Convers Manag 2021;247:114677. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ENCONMAN.2021.114677.
- [77] Wang H, Duanmu L, Lahdelma R, Li X. Developing a multicriteria decision support framework for CHP based combined district heating systems. Appl Energy 2017;205:345–68. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apenergy.2017.07.016.
- [78] Dai Y, Chen L, Min Y, Chen Q, Hu K, Hao J, et al. Dispatch model of combined heat and power plant considering heat transfer process. IEEE Trans Sustain Energy 2017;8:1225–36. https://doi.org/10.1109/TSTE.2017.2671744.
- [79] Jiang T, Min Y, Zhou G, Chen L, Chen Q, Xu F, et al. Hierarchical dispatch method for integrated heat and power systems considering the heat transfer process. Renew Sustain Energy Rev 2021;135. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. rser.2020.110412.
- [80] Fang H, Xia J, Jiang Y. Key issues and solutions in a district heating system using low-grade industrial waste heat. Energy 2015;86:589–602. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.energy.2015.04.052.
- [81] Luo A, Fang H, Xia J, Lin B, jiang Y. Mapping potentials of low-grade industrial waste heat in Northern China. Resour Conserv Recycl 2017;125:335–48. https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.resconrec.2017.06.018.
- [82] Li Y, Xia J, Su Y, Jiang Y. Systematic optimization for the utilization of lowtemperature industrial excess heat for district heating. Energy 2018;144:984–91. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2017.12.048.
- [83] Guo X, Xiao B. How can pricing strategy for district heating help China realize cleaner residential heating? Energy Econ 2022;110:106035. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/J.ENECO.2022.106035.
- [84] Feng T, Du H, Coffman DM, Qu A, Dong Z. Clean heating and heating poverty: a perspective based on cost-benefit analysis. Energy Pol 2021;152:112205. https:// doi.org/10.1016/J.ENPOL.2021.112205.
- [85] Xu S, Ge J. Sustainable shifting from coal to gas in North China: an analysis of resident satisfaction. Energy Pol 2020;138:111296. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. enpol.2020.111296.
- [86] Li H, You S, Zhang H, Zheng W, Zheng X, Jia J, et al. Modelling of AQI related to building space heating energy demand based on big data analytics. Appl Energy 2017;203:57–71. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apenergy.2017.06.002.
- [87] Fan S, Zha S, Zhao C, Sizheng F, Li M. Using energy vulnerability to measure distributive injustice in rural heating energy reform: a case study of natural gas replacing bulk coal for heating in Gaocheng District, Hebei Province, China. Ecol Econ 2022;197:107456. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ECOLECON.2022.107456.
- [88] Zhang W, Wang J, Xu Y, Wang C, Streets DG. Analyzing the spatio-temporal variation of the CO2 emissions from district heating systems with "Coal-to-Gas" transition: evidence from GTWR model and satellite data in China. Sci Total Environ 2022;803:150083. https://doi.org/10.1016/J. SCITOTENV 2021 150083
- [89] Wang W, Li F. Study on substitutable value of electric heating instead of coal heating in northern China under carbon constraints. J Clean Prod 2020;260: 121155. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.121155.
- [90] Wu S, Zheng X, Khanna N, Feng W. Fighting coal effectiveness of coalreplacement programs for residential heating in China: empirical findings from a household survey. Energy for Sustainable Development 2020;55:170–80. https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.esd.2020.02.002.
- [91] Fang H, Xia J, Zhu K, Su Y, Jiang Y. Industrial waste heat utilization for low temperature district heating. Energy Pol 2013;62:236–46. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.enpol.2013.06.104.
- [92] Zheng W, Zhang Y, Xia J, Jiang Y. Cleaner heating in Northern China: potentials and regional balances. Resour Conserv Recycl 2020;160. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.resconrec.2020.104897.
- [93] Sun F, Fu L, Zhang S, Sun J. New waste heat district heating system with combined heat and power based on absorption heat exchange cycle in China. Appl Therm Eng 2012;37:136–44. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. applthermaleng.2011.11.007.
- [94] Li Y, Mi P, Li W, Zhang S. Full operating conditions optimization study of new cogeneration heating system based on waste heat utilization of exhausted steam. Energy Convers Manag 2018;155:91–9. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. enconman.2017.10.081.
- [95] Li Y, Mi P, Li W, Zhang S. Full operating conditions optimization study of new cogeneration heating system based on waste heat utilization of exhausted steam. Energy Convers Manag 2018;155:91–9. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. enconman.2017.10.081.
- [96] Tai C, Tian G, Lei W. A water-heat combined supply system based on waste heat from a coastal nuclear power plant in northern China. Appl Therm Eng 2022;200: 117684. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.APPLTHERMALENG.2021.117684.

- [97] Hu B, Liu H, Jiang J, Zhang Z, Li H, Wang RZ. Ten megawatt scale vapor compression heat pump for low temperature waste heat recovery: onsite application research. Energy 2022;238:121699. https://doi.org/10.1016/J. ENERGY.2021.121699.
- [98] Li Y, Xia J, Fang H, Su Y, Jiang Y. Case study on industrial surplus heat of steel plants for district heating in Northern China. Energy 2016;102:397–405. https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2016.02.105.
- [99] He Z, Ding T, Liu Y, Li Z. Analysis of a district heating system using waste heat in a distributed cooling data center. Appl Therm Eng 2018;141:1131–40. https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.applthermaleng.2018.06.036.
- [100] Zhang P, Wang B, Wu W, Shi W, Li X. Heat recovery from internet data centers for space heating based on an integrated air conditioner with thermosyphon. Renew Energy 2015;80:396–406. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.renene.2015.02.032.
- [101] Wang W, Dong Z. Economic benefits assessment of urban wind power central heating demonstration project considering the quantification of environmental benefits: a case from northern China. Energy 2021;225:120246. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.energy.2021.120246.
- [102] Wang J, Zhou Z, Zhao J, Zheng J, Guan Z. Optimizing for clean-heating improvements in a district energy system with high penetration of wind power. Energy 2019;175:1085–99. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2019.03.153.
- [103] Wang J, Zhou Z, Zhao J, Zheng J. Improving wind power integration by a novel short-term dispatch model based on free heat storage and exhaust heat recycling. Energy 2018;160:940–53. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2018.07.018.
- [104] Song S, Liu P, Xu J, Ma L, Chong C, He M, et al. An economic and policy analysis of a district heating system using corn straw densified fuel: a case study in Nong'an County in Jilin Province, China. Energies 2017;10. https://doi.org/ 10.3390/en10010008.
- [105] Zhao J, Yuan Y, Ren Y, Wang H. Environmental assessment of crop residue processing methods in rural areas of Northeast China. Renew Energy 2015;84: 22–9. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.renene.2015.06.063.
- [106] Ma S, Guo S, Zheng D, Chang S, Zhang X. Roadmap towards clean and low carbon heating to 2035: a provincial analysis in northern China. Energy 2021:225. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2021.120164.
- [107] Huang J, Fan J, Furbo S, Chen D, Dai Y, Kong W. Economic analysis and optimization of combined solar district heating technologies and systems. Energy 2019;186. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2019.115886.
- [108] Guo F, Yang X. Long-term performance simulation and sensitivity analysis of a large-scale seasonal borehole thermal energy storage system for industrial waste heat and solar energy. Energy Build 2021;236. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. enbuild.2021.110768.
- [109] Li Z, Xu M, Huai X, Huang C, Wang K. Simulation and analysis of thermochemical seasonal solar energy storage for district heating applications in China. Int J Energy Res 2021;45:7093–107. https://doi.org/10.1002/er.6295.
- [110] Guo F, Zhu X, Zhang J, Yang X. Large-scale living laboratory of seasonal borehole thermal energy storage system for urban district heating. Appl Energy 2020;264. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apenergy.2020.114763.
- [111] Huang J, Fan J, Furbo S. Demonstration and optimization of a solar district heating system with ground source heat pumps. Sol Energy 2020;202:171–89. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.solener.2020.03.097.
  [112] Zhang Q, Chen S, Tan Z, Zhang T, Mclellan B. Investment strategy of
- [112] Zhang Q, Chen S, Tan Z, Zhang T, Mclellan B. Investment strategy of hydrothermal geothermal heating in China under policy, technology and geology uncertainties. J Clean Prod 2019;207:17–29. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. jclepro.2018.09.240.
- [113] Chen S, Zhang Q, Li H, Mclellan B, Zhang T, Tan Z. Investment decision on shallow geothermal heating & cooling based on compound options model: a case study of China. Appl Energy 2019;254:113655. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. apenergy.2019.113655.
- [114] Sun F, Zhao X, Chen X, Fu L, Liu L. New configurations of district heating system based on natural gas and deep geothermal energy for higher energy efficiency in northern China. Appl Therm Eng 2019;151:439–50. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. applthermaleng.2019.02.043.
- [115] Yan Q, Qin C. Environmental and economic benefit analysis of an integrated heating system with geothermal energy—a case study in Xi'an China. Energies 2017;10. https://doi.org/10.3390/en10122090.
- [116] Chen Q. District or distributed space heating in rural residential sector? Empirical evidence from a discrete choice experiment in South China. Energy Pol 2021;148. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2020.111937.
- [117] Luo M, de Dear R, Ji W, Bin C, Lin B, Ouyang Q, et al. The dynamics of thermal comfort expectations: the problem, challenge and impication. Build Environ 2016;95:322–9. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.buildenv.2015.07.015.
- [118] Zheng W, Hennessy JJ, Li H. Reducing renewable power curtailment and CO2 emissions in China through district heating storage. Wiley Interdiscip Rev Energy Environ 2020;9. https://doi.org/10.1002/wene.361.
  [119] Li P, Wang H, Lv Q, Li W. Combined heat and power dispatch considering heat
- [119] Li P, Wang H, Lv Q, Li W. Combined heat and power dispatch considering heat storage of both buildings and pipelines in district heating system for wind power integration. Energies 2017;10. https://doi.org/10.3390/en10070893.
- [120] Zheng J, Zhou Z, Zhao J, Wang J. Effects of the operation regulation modes of district heating system on an integrated heat and power dispatch system for wind power integration. Appl Energy 2018;230:1126–39. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. appenergy.2018.09.077.
- [121] Xiong W, Wang Y, Mathiesen BV, Lund H, Zhang X. Heat roadmap China: new heat strategy to reduce energy consumption towards 2030. Energy 2015;81: 274–85. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2014.12.039.
- [122] Li L, Jin W, Shen M, Yang L, Chen F, Wang L, et al. Coordinated dispatch of integrated energy systems considering the differences of multiple functional areas. Appl Sci 2019;9. https://doi.org/10.3390/app9102103.

- [123] Zhang H, Zhou L, Huang X, Zhang X. Decarbonizing a large City's heating system using heat pumps: a case study of Beijing. Energy 2019;186. https://doi.org/ 0.1016/j.energy.2019.07.150.
- [124] Li Y, Wang C, Li G, Chen C. Optimal scheduling of integrated demand responseenabled integrated energy systems with uncertain renewable generations: a Stackelberg game approach. Energy Convers Manag 2021;235. https://doi.org/ 0.1016/i.enconman. 2021.113996
- [125] Wang P, Poovendran P, Manokaran KB. Fault detection and control in integrated energy system using machine learning. Sustain Energy Technol Assessments 2021;47:101366. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.SETA.2021.101366.
- [126] Tahir MF, Haoyong C, Guangze H. Exergy hub based modelling and performance evaluation of integrated energy system. J Energy Storage 2021;41:102912. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.EST.2021.102912.
- [127] Tong K, Fang A, Yu H, Li Y, Shi L, Wang Y, et al. Estimating the potential for industrial waste heat reutilization in urban district energy systems: method development and implementation in two Chinese provinces. Environ Res Lett 2017;12:125008. https://doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/aa8a17
- [128] Fu L, Li Y, Wu Y, Wang X, Jiang Y. Low carbon district heating in China in 2025- a district heating mode with low grade waste heat as heat source. Energy 2021;230: 120765. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ENERGY.2021.120765.
- [129] Zhao X, Fu L, Li F, Wang X. Study of the modes for tapping the latent power in utilizing the waste heat of a gas heat and power cogeneration system. J Eng Therm Energy Power 2014:349-354+45. https://doi.org/10.16146/j.cnki rndlgc.2014.04.008 (in Chinese).
- [130] Li Y, Chen G, Zhang S, Fu L. Research on flue gas waste heat recovery system in gas-steam combined cycle power plant. Journal of HV&AC 2017:86-90+118 (in Chinese).
- [131] Zhao X, Fu L, Wang X, Sun T, Zhang S. Analysis of the recovery system of flue gas from combined heat and power plant with distributed peak-shaving heat pumps n.d.
- [132] Zhao M, Shen T. Combined heat and power generation transformation and heating capacity analysis of air cooling units with large capacity. Therm Power Gener 2021:138-44. https://doi.org/10.19666/j.rlfd.202005168 (in Chinese).
- [133] Sun F, Yang H, Fu L, Gao W. Operation characteristics and application of low temperature industrial waste heating system based on compression heat exchanger (in Chinese). 2018. p. 1495. -501.
- [134] He Z, Kong L, Sun T, Wei M, Zhang S, Fu L, et al. New technology and scheme of waste heat supply based on absorption heat transfer (in Chinese) Journal of HV&AC 2017:130. -3.
- [135] Fang H, Li Y, Xia J, Zhao H. Key issues and solutions of low-grade industrial waste heat applied (in Chinese) Journal of HV&AC 2016:15–22.
- [136] Sun F, Bao Y, Fu K, Xie Y. Low temperature district heating system integrated with recycled water based on absorption heat pumps. Build Sci 2021:121-6. https:// doi.org/10.13614/j.cnki.11-1962/tu.2021.02.18 (in Chinese).
- [137] Lin C, Wu W, Wang B, Sun Y. Coordinated dispatch method of heat and power systems considering peaking ancillary services. Electr power 2019:45-53 (in Chinese).
- [138] Zhang H, Guo Y. Research on economic evaluation of distributed thermal storage electric boilers based on multi party participation to eliminate abandoned wind and light power. Computers and Applied Chemistry 2019:174-84. https://doi. org/10.16866/i.com.app.chem201902011, in Chinese.
- [139] Chen G, Xia Z, Yan B, Zhou WWO. Technical and economic analysis of biomass gasification for heating in rural areas (in Chinese) Renewable Energy Resources 2014:1395. https://doi.org/10.13941/j.cnki.21-1469/tk.2014.09.024. -9.
- [140] Sun Z, Bian Z. Hebei biomass densified biofuel industry development research (in Chinese) Renewable Energy Resources 2013:126. https://doi.org/10.13941/j nki.21-1469/tk.2013.06.019. -8.
- [141] Wang C, Guo F, Zhu Y, Yang X. Design and optimization of large-scale seasonal borehole thermal energy storage system for solar energy (in Chinese) Acta

Energiae Solaris Sin 2021:320-7. https://doi.org/10.19912/j.0254-0096. tvnxb.2019-1432.

- [142] Zhang Q, Cao M, Zhang Q, Di H. Research of composite central heating system using absorption heat pump to extract shallow geothermal (in Chinese) Acta Energiae Solaris Sin 2017:1674. -9.
- [143] Wang X, Fu L, Zhang S, Zhao X, Liu H. Performance analysis of central heating system combining urban heating network with geothermal energy (in Chinese) Journal of HV&AC 2014:93. -9.
- [144] Wang J, Zhou Z, Zhao J, Zheng J. Economical planning of clean heating project to enhance wind energy accommodation (in Chinese) J Harbin Inst Technol 2019: 171. -8.
- [145] Zhang H, Guo Y. Research on economic evaluation of distributed thermal storage electric boilers based on multi party participation to eliminate abandoned wind and light power (in Chinese) Computers and Applied Chemistry 2019:174-84. bi.org/10.16866/j.com.app.chem201902011. https:
- [146] Zhu J, Pan F, Zhou X, Wang Q, Su Z. Research on clean heating technology and further reduction of electricity cost-exploration of trading mode for thermal storage electric heating load in medium and long-term electricity market. Price: Theory & Practice 2020:91-4. https://doi.org/10.19851/j.cnki.cn11-1010/ f.2020.03.359 (in Chinese).
- [147] Zhu J, Zhu Q. Economy and pricing strategy of new clean heating technology-an analysis on molten-salt thermal energy storage project by electricity heating. Price: Theory & Practice 2019:129-32. https://doi.org/10.19851/j.cnki.cn11-1010/f.2019.01.032 (in Chinese).
- [148] Lin C, Wu W, Wang B, Sun Y. Coordinated dispatch method of heat and power systems considering peaking ancillary services. Electr power 2019:45-53 (in Chinese).
- [149] SAMR, NDRC, MIIT, MNR, MEE, MOHURD. Establish and improve the implementation plan of carbon peak and carbon neutral standard measurement system. 2022. https://www.gov.cn/zhengce/zhengceku/2022-11/01/5723071/ files/456978e8376e43fa80a0ce26ea6622c7.pdf. [Accessed 1 June 2023].
- [150] Sorknæs P, Nielsen S, Lund H, Mathiesen BV, Moreno D, Thellufsen JZ. The benefits of 4th generation district heating and energy efficient datacentres. Energy 2022;260:125215. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ENERGY.2022.125215.
- [151] Dorotić H, Čuljak K, Miškić J, Pukšec T, Duić N. Technical and economic assessment of supermarket and power substation waste heat integration into existing district heating systems. Energies 2022;15. https://doi.org/10.3390/ en15051666.
- [152] Kany MS, Mathiesen BV, Skov IR, Korberg AD, Thellufsen JZ, Lund H, et al. Energy efficient decarbonisation strategy for the Danish transport sector by 2045. Smart Energy 2022;5:100063. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.SEGY.2022.100063.
- [153] Skov IR, Schneider N, Incentive structures for power-to-X and e-fuel pathways for transport in EU and member states. Energy Pol 2022;168:113121. https://doi. org/10.1016/J.ENPOL.2022.113121.
- National Development and Reform Commission. Medium- and long-term plan for [154] the development of the hydrogen energy industry (2021-2035). 2022.
- Askeland K, Rygg BJ, Sperling K. The role of 4th generation district heating [155] (4GDH) in a highly electrified hydropower dominated energy system - the case of Norway. International Journal of Sustainable Energy Planning and Management 2020;27:17-34. https://doi.org/10.5278/ijsepm.3683.
- Ziemele J, Cilinskis E, Blumberga D. Pathway and restriction in district heating [156] systems development towards 4th generation district heating. Energy 2018;152: 108–18. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ENERGY.2018.03.122. Lygnerud K, Langer S. Urban sustainability: recovering and utilizing urban excess
- [157] heat. Energies 2022:15. https://doi.org/10.3390/en15249466.
- [158] Nielsen S, Hansen K, Lund R, Moreno D, Unconventional excess heat sources for district heating in a national energy system context. Energies 2020;13. https:// doi.org/10.3390/en13195068.